OASIS BPEL4People TC F2F – Minutes – 2008/01/20

Agenda

Role call and assignment of minute takers:

Martin Chapman, Frank Leyman, Dieter Koenig, Ralf Meuller and Gerhard Pfau took minutes.

Meeting Attendees		
Name	Company	Status
Luc Clement	Active Endpoints, Inc.	Group Member
Michael Rowley	Active Endpoints, Inc.	Group Member
Dave Ings	IBM	Group Member
Matthias Kloppmann	IBM	Group Member
Dieter Koenig	IBM	Group Member
Frank Leymann	IBM	Group Member
Gerhard Pfau	IBM	Group Member
Gershon Janssen	Individual	Group Member
Yoichi Takayama	Individual	Group Member
Phillip Allen	Microsoft Corporation	Group Member
Alexander Malek	Microsoft Corporation	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ralf Mueller	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Sabine Holz	SAP AG*	Group Member
Oliver Kieselbach	SAP AG*	Group Member
Benjamin Notheis	SAP AG*	Group Member
Hannah Petereit	SAP AG*	Group Member
Ivana Trickovic	SAP AG*	Group Member
Alireza Farhoush	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member

Supplementary Notes:

- The 2/4 TC is cancelled.
- The next F2F is tentatively scheduled for Tuesday May 12th 9 AM through Thursday May 14th 12 noon, at a TBD North American east coast location.

- Hannah Petereit and Yoichi Takayama acquired and Krasmimir Nedkov lost voting rights as of the end of the F2F. This status change becomes official when these minutes are approved.
- Informal working sessions for task routing patterns are now being held every two weeks. See the TC calendar on Kavi for details. These informal sessions do not count towards acquiring TC voting rights. Only those TC members who wish to work on this topic need attend.

Minutes – 2009/01/20:

Martin C: Scribe: Martin C
Martin C: Agenda review:
Martin C: Tuesday 1/20 20 9 AM - 12 noon

1. Welcome, roll call, assignment of initial minute taker, agenda review - 15 minutes

According to the chair's notes, the minute taker candidates are (in order) Martin, Dieter, Frank, and Alex

2. Review and approval of the previous TC minutes - 5 minutes

http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200812/msg00044.html

3. Discuss New Issues - 30 minutes

Issues 62 & 63 - Dieter

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-62
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-62

4. Discuss Open Issues - 15 minutes

Issue 20 - Phil et al

This issue has been open but unassigned since 10/1. We should agree upon what to do with it (or close it).

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-42

5. Constellation 4 Interoperability - Alex & Phil - 60 minutes

Tuesday Jan 20 1 PM - 5 PM

1. IBM/SAP Presentation on Task Routing Proposal - 2 hours

http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00007.html

2. Committee Draft 2 Discussion & Potential Approval Vote - Luc Clement - 1 hour

To accommodate Luc dialing in from North America, will start at 9 AM ET / 3 PM CET

http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00002.html

3. Resume discussion on IBM/SAP presentation - 1 hour

Wednesday 1/21 - 9 AM to 5 PM

1. Working session on task routing proposal(s) - - 5 hours

2. Michael to review proposals for issues 36, 44, 45 - 2 hours

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-36
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-44
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-45

Thursday 1/22 - 9 AM - 12 noon

1. To be scheduled depending on preceding two day's discussion.
Martin C: Michael and Yoici on wednesday morning. Time TBD
Martin C: Topic: minutes
Martin C: 10th December Minutes:
Martin C: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200812/msg00044.html
Martin C: Gershon: moves to accept minutes. Mike R 2nds
Martin C: Motion passed w/o
Martin C: Topic: New issues
Martin C: Issue 62: http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-62
Martin C: xml schema problem in ws-humantask
Martin C: Deiter Moves to open, 2nd Gerhard.
Martin C: s/deiter/dieter
Martin C: motion passed w/o
Martin C: Mike R moves to resolve issue 62 with proposal in JIRA
Martin C: Dieter 2nds
Martin C: Motions passed w/o
Martin C: Issue 62 is reolved
Martin C: Issue 63: http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-63

Martin C: Actual Owner Missing in WS-HumanTask Context
Martin C: Dieter moves to open, Phil 2nds
Martin C: motion passed w/o
Martin C: Discussion on both proposals in jira, keeping it as one complextask or splitting into request and resonse.
Martin C: discussion deffered until thursday morning.
Martin C: Topic:
Martin C: Issue 20: http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-20
Martin C: s/20/42/
Martin C: Issue 42: http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-42
anonymous1 morphed into Hannah Petereit
Martin C: The tc re-confirmed it wished to work on this issue. Phil is assigned this issue and will come back with a proposal.
Martin C: Topic: Constellation 4 Interoperability
Martin C break for 15 minutes
Martin C: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00011.html
Martin C: Discussion related around deployment scope
Martin C: vs benefits
Martin C: Action: Alex/Phil to open a new issue to detail the problem statement for Constellation and Interoperability
Martin C: Topic: IBM/SAP Presentation on Task Routing Proposal
Martin C: Dieter presents: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00007.html
Martin C: Oliver takes over presentation on compsite tasks
Martin C: s/compsite/composite/
Martin C: Break for lunch
Dieter Koenig: will resume at 13:30 local time
Frank Leymann: Frank becomes humble scribe
Frank Leymann: Resume at 1:50pm
Frank Leymann: Oliver continues presentation: composite tasks
Frank Leymann: All: Discussion
Frank Leymann: Break for 10 minutes
Frank Leymann: Resume
Frank Leymann: Luc's presentation on Committee Draft 02
Frank Leymann: DocRef: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/download.php/30552/cd-02.zip
Frank Leymann: TC members will have a chance to review CD2
Frank Leymann: Luc will upload a DOC version with revisions marked up

Frank Leymann: Deadline for reviewing CD2 is the next TC call

Frank Leymann: Comments comming up during review should be send out to e-mail list before next TC call

Frank Leymann: BP-16 now coupled with the other BPs applied to CD2

Frank Leymann: Agreement: In future, all changes on a draft should be identifiable via DOC markings as long as the TC accepted the DOC as new CD

Frank Leymann: Topic: Routing Patter & Composite Tasks

Frank Leymann: Should Routing Patterns have their own syntax (in addition to Composite Tasks)?

Frank Leymann: Current majority is in favour (8:3:3)

Frank Leymann: Discussion is on the basic (!) difference between the concept of task routing and task composition.

Frank Leymann: Intense discussion on "do composite tasks require completion conditions?"

Frank Leymann: Some people view task routing as "flows through org structure", which feels different from composite tasks

Frank Leymann: Should we have (1) routing tasks with no actual owner and automatic completion, and (2) composite tasks that have (!) an actual owner who especially explicitly declares a composite task as completed?

Frank Leymann: Refinement: Should we have (1) routing tasks with no actual owner and automatic completion, and (2) composite tasks that have an actual owner?

Frank Leymann: Staw poll has staled...

Frank Leymann: Correction: it failed

Frank Leymann: We need more information on these concepts to decide whether to go ahead with both or not (e.g. result aggregation)

Frank Leymann: ***Meeting closes for the day***

Minutes – 2009/01/21:

[9:02] Dieter Koenig: Scribe (Jan 21, morning): Dieter

[9:06] Dieter Koenig: Agenda for Jan 21

Wednesday 1/21 - 9 AM to 5 PM

1. Review New Issues Opened by Yoichi - up to 2 hours

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-64
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-65
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-66
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-67
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-68

2. Michael to review proposals for issues 36, 44, 45 - up
to 2 hours

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-36
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-44
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-45

[9:12] Dieter Koenig: Topic 1. Review New Issues Opened by
Yoichi - up
to 2 hours

[9:17] Dieter Koenig: Slides attached here:
http://www.oasis-
open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/2009
01/msg00027.html

[9:17] Dave Ings: Yoichi, we have lost your connection, are
you there?

[9:17] yoichi: hello?

[9:17] anonymous morphed into Hannah Petereit

[9:18] Dave Ings: Hello are you on mute?

[9:18] Dave Ings: we can't hear you!!

[9:18] yoichi: No, but I will try different handset

[9:18] anonymous1 morphed into Alireza Farhoush

[9:18] Dave Ings: Perhaps dial in again?

[9:19] yoichi: calling

[9:23] Dieter Koenig: Yoichi walks thru the slides for the new issue
BP-64 ...

[9:34] Dave Ings: Yoichi, the line is half-duplex, can you please
pause quite often to allow questions etc

[9:47] Dieter Koenig: For the coordination between task parent runtime
and task runtime, see also figure 1 in chapter 7 of ws-ht

[9:50] anonymous morphed into Phil Allen

[9:52] Dieter Koenig: OASIS email links to issues 64-68
BP-64: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00010.html
BP-65: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00023.html
BP-66: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00020.html
BP-67: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00021.html
BP-68: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/2009

01/msg00022.html

[9:55] Dieter Koenig: Need to add a comment to BP-65: add a
overview
figure to the spec, describing the overall architecture
including the
task parent, the tasklist, the client, and the interactions
between them

[9:57] Alireza Farhoush: A couple of things to add:
description of
each component of the architecture in detail, and providing
a glossary
describing all related terms.

[9:58] Dave Ings: Note that 65 is purely descriptive in
nature and not
normative

[9:58] Dieter Koenig: Motion: accept BP-65 as amended by
the above
enhancements (m: Phil, s: Gerhard)

[9:59] Dieter Koenig: No objection - BP-65 is opened

[10:00] Dieter Koenig: BP-65 is assigned to Frank

[10:00] Dieter Koenig: next subtopic: BP-66

[10:01] Dieter Koenig: Motion to close BP-66 without action
(m:
Gerhard, s: Martin) - no objections - BP-66 is closed

[10:02] Dieter Koenig: next subtopic: BP-67

[10:05] Dieter Koenig: Motion to close BP-67 with no action
-
duplicate of BP-65 - (m: Gerhard, s: Dieter) - no objection
- BP-67 is
closed

[10:05] Dieter Koenig: next subtopic: BP-68

[10:11] Dieter Koenig: Motion to open BP-68 - (m: Michael

R, s:
Dieter) - no objection - BP-68 is opened

[10:11] Dave Ings: Proposal: resolve 68 by deleting the
sentence at
2298 "The value of this element is taken from the
htd:remoteTask/
@responseOperation attribute." in HT.

[10:12] Dieter Koenig: Motion to resolve BP-68 as described
above -
(m: Michael R, s: Matthias)

[10:13] Dieter Koenig: No objection - BP-68 is resolved

[10:14] Dieter Koenig: ----------- 10 min break -----------
-

[10:27] Dieter Koenig: Next topic: 2. Michael to review
proposals for
issues 36, 44, 45

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-36
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-44
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-45

[10:28] Dieter Koenig: BP-36 doc attached to
http://www.oasis-
open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/2009
01/msg00025.html

[10:30] Dieter Koenig: first subtopic: BP-44

[10:31] Dieter Koenig: BP-44 proposal in
http://lists.oasis-
open.org/archives/bpel4people/200812/msg00034.html

[10:45] Dieter Koenig: Need to discuss "bulk"/"batch"
operations ==
operations invoked for a list of task ids

[10:48] Dieter Koenig: Gerhard will submit a separate issue

[10:49] Dieter Koenig: The new issue will address single
operations on

a set of tasks

[10:53] Dieter Koenig: Mike R. will submit a revised proposal that
addresses extensibility

[10:53] Dieter Koenig: next subtopic: BP-36

[11:00] Dieter Koenig: Operation getTaskDetails() already exists
(after the resolution of BP-61):
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-61

[11:04] Dieter Koenig: WS-HT section 3.4 defines "task
instance data"

[11:09] Dieter Koenig: Proposal: call the new operation
"getTaskInstanceData()"

[11:25] Dieter Koenig: Reconcile proposal with BP-61

[11:25] Dieter Koenig: next subtopic: BP-45

[11:26] Dieter Koenig: Proposal attached here:
http://www.oasis-
open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/2009
01/msg00012.html

[11:32] Dieter Koenig: Discussion about the relationship
between task
instance lifecycle and task instance history lifecycle

[12:19] Dieter Koenig: Need to define what data is returned
by the
getTaskHistory operation (security aspect)

[12:20] Dieter Koenig: TBD:
(1) task history for simple tasks (see Mike's proposal)
(2) task history sharing for composite tasks
(3) task history sharing with task parent

[12:28] Dieter Koenig: Need to define the granularity of
filter criteria

[12:29] Dieter Koenig: Need to have an approach for paging
(start
index, max events) consistent with task instance query

operations

[12:32] Dieter Koenig: Gerhard will raise a new issue for a consistent
paging approach in query operations

[12:38] Dieter Koenig: ----------- lunch break -----------

[13:58] Ralf Mueller: Taking over scribe from Dieter

[13:58] anonymous morphed into Dave Ings

[14:00] Ralf Mueller: Alex to present Task Parent to Task Processor
Interop form simple task types

[14:11] Ralf Mueller: Discussed deployment of human interactions to
Task Processors, are there cases that require standardization because
of tighter coupling between B4P and WST-HT Processor ?

[14:38] Ralf Mueller: Alex to formalize the concept of lean task, task
outcomes and API

[14:39] Ralf Mueller: 10 minute break.

[14:59] Ralf Mueller: Agenda Items for Thursday: Human Task Context
(request/response) (Dieter), Get Task operations API (Mike)

[15:05] Dave Ings: Proposed motion: the decision of the TC is to base
subsequent discussion and evolution (i.e. the baseline proposal)
regarding issue 28 upon the most recent slide deck provided by IBM and
SAP and as discussed on 1/20 at the F2F.

[15:05] Ralf Mueller: Ivana moves, Martin seconds

[15:06] Ralf Mueller: Motion unanimously carried

[15:09] Ralf Mueller: Dieter to present Result Aggregation
proposal
for routing patterns

[15:45] Ralf Mueller: Hannah to present on Input and Output
handling
for Composite Tasks

[16:36] Ralf Mueller: Continued the discussion with
Attachments and
Comments

[17:04] Ralf Mueller: Group Discussion on Composite Tasks,
Lean Tasks,
process vs. task

[17:18] Ralf Mueller: End of Discussion at 5:15pm

Minutes – 2009/01/22:

Dave Ings: Thursday 1/22 - 9 AM - 12:30 PM

Meeting will adjourn at 12:30, lunch will be served for those still present.

1. Final issue proposal discussions - up to 30 minutes

Dieter - http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-63
Michael - http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/BP-44

2. Constellation 4 Interoperability - Further Discussion -
Alex & Phil - up to 30 minutes

3. Working session on task routing proposal(s) - up to 3 hours

4. Final remarks / discussion of place and timing of next F2F - Chair
Gerhard Pfau: Scribe: Gerhard
Gerhard Pfau: Dieter presents proposed resolution of BP-63
anonymous morphed into Hannah Petereit
Gerhard Pfau: Dave assigns BP-63 (previously unassigned) to Dieter
Gerhard Pfau: Michael presents proposed resolution for BP-44
Dave Ings: Revised proposal email link: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/bpel4people/email/archives/200901/msg00041.html
Gerhard Pfau: Michael moves o resolve BP-44, Dieter seconds
Gerhard Pfau: Motion unanimously carried
Gerhard Pfau: Alex presents thoughts on lean tasks, deployment, etc.
Gerhard Pfau: Group discussion around how to create / start / delete lean task
Gerhard Pfau: Discussion about extending people activity to invoke lean task in a new way (not via remote task)
Gerhard Pfau: Discussion if lean tasks should have a rendering
Gerhard Pfau: There is consensus in the room that lean tasks optionally can define a rendering
Gerhard Pfau: Next steps: Alex and Phil to work with SAP to iterate the BP-44 proposal
Gerhard Pfau: Goal is to present another iteration at the next TC meeting

Gerhard Pfau: Coffee break until 10:55
Gerhard Pfau: Meeting continues
Gerhard Pfau: Alex is presenting motivational scenario for routing patterns
Gerhard Pfau: .. using Sharepoint as an example
Gerhard Pfau: Example scenario: Purchase Order Approval
Gerhard Pfau: Supports adding tasks to a chain of tasks
Gerhard Pfau: Currently don't use output. Instead uses comments and (the aggregate of) "approve" / "disapprove"
Gerhard Pfau: Ralf presenting the Oracle routing pattern scenarios
Gerhard Pfau: Oeacle uses task payload, not input / output when modeling a human task
Gerhard Pfau: Task have a predefined (extensible) set of task outcomes
Gerhard Pfau: Assignment and routing policies are assigned to a task: Single, Sequential, Parallel
Gerhard Pfau: "Application roles" are used similar to LPGs. Alternatively people / groups / roles are used when defining the single / sequential / parallel
Gerhard Pfau: Routing patterns can be nested
Gerhard Pfau: Default outcome used when people do not respond in the expected amount of time
Gerhard Pfau: Observation: HR people have the most complex routing requirements
Gerhard Pfau: In collaboration mode in parallel the data is copied
Gerhard Pfau: result aggregation: pick one
Gerhard Pfau: From the process perspective a human task (routing task) is considered a black box
Gerhard Pfau: Discussion about Oracle requiring ad-hoc subtasks in their scenario
Gerhard Pfau: According to Ralf currently not required. The original task is temporarily transferred / shared.
Gerhard Pfau: Oliver: HR scenario similar to BPMN subflow
Gerhard Pfau: Alireza: Seems that the scenarios presented by both Oracle and Microsoft seem to be similar.
Gerhard Pfau: Discussion: How to structure work on routing patterns / subtasks
Gerhard Pfau: Proposal: Every 2nd week during the usual TC meeting have a meeting that brings people together working on routing patterns / subtasks
Gerhard Pfau: Correction: Proposal: Every 2nd week during the usual TC meeting time slot have a meeting that brings people together working on routing patterns / subtasks.
Gerhard Pfau: These meetings are informal.

Gerhard Pfau: IBM is going to set up the first meeting (January 2.
Gerhard Pfau: ... January 2
Gerhard Pfau: January 28)
Gerhard Pfau: Dave discusses next steps
Gerhard Pfau: Agreement that at least one more technical f2f is required
Gerhard Pfau: Proposal to have next f2f sometime in May
Gerhard Pfau: Proposal: Week of May 11: Start Tuesday 9am, end: Thursday noon
Gerhard Pfau: Tentative location: US east coast
Gerhard Pfau: There is agreement in the room to go ahead with the above proposal for the next f2f
Gerhard Pfau: Dave declares meeting adjourned.