DRAFT

SCA-Policy TC Teleconference

29 OCT 2007

Chair

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
fred carter	AmberPoint	Group Member
Dale Moberg	Axway Software*	Group Member
Michael Rowley	BEA Systems, Inc.	Group Member
Jacques Durand	Fujitsu Limited*	Group Member
Tom Rutt	Fujitsu Limited*	Group Member
Robert Freund	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Eisaku Nishiyama	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Michael Beisiegel	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Uday Joshi	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Kaanu Joshi	Patni Software	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Jeff Mischkinsky	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ron Barack	SAP AG*	Group Member
Sanjay Patil	SAP AG*	Group Member
Prasad Yendluri	Software AG, Inc.*	Group Member
Fabian Ritzmann	Sun Microsystems	Group Member

| Tai-Hsing Cha | TIBCO Software Inc. | Group Member |
| Pundalik Kudapkar | TIBCO Software Inc. | Group Member |

Contents

Resolutions

1. Minutes of Policy TC meeting of 1st October accepted with amendments to replace the 2 TC private URLs with equivalent public URLs.2. The errata, as specified in the email sent to the list on 25th October, shall be applied directly to the Policy specification by the editors.

Actions

Action: 2007-10-29#1 Mike Rowley to perfect and publish the proposal wording

Agenda

```
1. Roll call

2. Appointment of minute taker – Mike Edwards returns

3. Agenda bashing

4. Vote to accept minutes from previous meeting
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00093.html

5. Followup on Action Items:
```

a.Mike R to post clarification of issue 7 to mailing list:
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00092.html
b.Mike R to post clarification of issue 8 to mailing list:
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00091.html
c.Issues Editor to update Issue 5 with resolution from Oct 22 Telecon
- add URL pointer to approved minutes in resolution text

6. ISSUES

a. Issue 7 - Required intents on interfaces – Michael Rowley
http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/sca-policy/email/archives/200710/msg00018.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-7
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00101.html

b. Issue 8 - Add 'conversational' intent to Policy Framework
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00025.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-8
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00091.html

c. Requirements for Policy Framework Document
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00046.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-13

d. Intent/intentMap Relationship
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00043.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-10

e. WS-I compliance versus QoS policy
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00042.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-9

f. Binding config relationship to policySet
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00044.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-11

g. Annotations for policy intents
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00045.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-12

h. Binding hierarchies need to be considered in
policyReference matching
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00047.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-14

i. External mechanism for attaching intents or policySets
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00048.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-15

j, Targeting policySets to bingings.ws
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00049.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-16

k. Need Transaction Policy Spec
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00050.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-17

l. Should qualifiable intents have a default qualifier?
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00051.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-18

7. NEW ISSUES
• ISSUE 34: Wiring from a reference with no binding to a
service with a binding
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00085.html

• ISSUE POLICY-33 : The ability to express capabilities via
intents
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00084.html

• ISSUE POLICY-32 : Security intent which allows a client
toauthenticate a server

http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00083.html

- ISSUE POLICY-31 : Is it possible to use only a piece of a moregeneral policySet?
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00082.html

- ISSUE POLICY-30: Is the policy (specified in intentMap) from all ofmultiple qualified intents in effect?
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00081.html

- ISSUE POLICY-29: Need more precision on when policies in apolicySet are in effect
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00080.html

- ISSUE POLICY-28 : Add the ability to attach policy directly to anSCA composite
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00079.html

- ISSUE POLICY-27: Operation level policy attachment is broken
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00078.html

- ISSUE POLICY-26 : Security implementation policy should bevalidate-able by schema
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00077.html

- ISSUE POLICY-25 : XPath expressions for intent/@constrains
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00076.html

- ISSUE POLICY-24 : More direct, structural qualifier definition
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00075.html

- ISSUE POLICY-23 : Policy attachment at the message level
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00074.html

```
• ISSUE POLICY-22 : Profile intent extension - provides
other intents
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00073.html

• ISSUE POLICY-21 : always provides in binding specs
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00072.html

• ISSUE POLICY-20: Should intents have a default policySet
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00071.html

• ISSUE POLICY-19: Composite/Group policy
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-
policy/200710/msg00070.html

8. Need to fold in errata into 1.1 Framework spec.
- Are we awaiting donation of the errata by all OSOA
companies?

9. AOB

10. Any additions to the roll?
```

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

Agenda modified as follows:

> .1 (Michael Rowley) New Item to consider the Errata changes sent to the mailing list, before Item 6.

> .2 (Dave Booz) Change the order of Items 7 and 6 (they were in the wrong order in the original agenda).

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Discussion (Anish) that the minutes contain 2 URLs that are not public

Michael Rowley: Moves to accept the minutes with amendments
Anish Karmarkar: seconds
Agreed unanimously

Resolution: 1. Minutes of Policy TC meeting of 1st October accepted with amendments to replace the 2 TC private URLs with equivalent public URLs.

(Item 5) Follow-up on Action Items

Items 5a) and 5b) are complete.

Item 5c) – Kaanu Joshi to update the relevant issue in the JIRA system

(Item 6) Posted Errata Items

Michael Rowley would like to direct the Editors to apply the errata without raising separate issues.

Michael Rowley moves to apply the errata directly to the spec draft
Michael Beisiegel seconds

Accepted unanimously

> **Resolution: 2. The errata, as specified in the email sent to the list on 25th October, shall be applied directly to the Policy specification by the editors.**

(Item 7) New Issues

There are a set of new issues that have been moved from the OSOA Issues list, in parallel with the errata discussed in Item 6. These issues have numbers 19 through 34 inclusive.

Michael Rowley moves that we accept as open issues 19 through 34 as a group
Mike Edwards seconds

Accepted unanimously

> **Resolution: 3. Issues 19 through 34 inclusive are accepted as open issues.**

(Item 8) Open Issues

Issue #7: Implicit addition of intents based on a service or reference's @requires list

http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/sca-policy/email/archives/200710/msg00018.html
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-7

http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200710/msg00101.html

There is disagreement about visibility of interface intents to clients and services

Michael R thinks that the current spec allows for intents to be attached to interfaces already

Sanjay thinks that client may use different copy of interface definition that may not have the same intents
- suggests a simplification of the language based on this

Michael R thinks it is important to say why intents might be specified on an interface

<debate on these points>

Anish suggests modification of wording to allow editors to fix RFC2119 keywords.

Michael R suggests RFC2119 wording should not be used for end-users. Anish would like the words replaced entirely with non RFC2119 words.

Dave B suggests removing final sentence.

Anish makes suggested changes to the wording. "Intents can be specified on interfaces when they are be seen by both the provider"

Table this item

Action: 2007-10-29#1 Mike Rowley to perfect and publish the proposal wording

Issue #8: Add conversational intent to Policy Framework

(Michael Rowley) - Conversational intent is described in Assembly spec

- add wording in the Policy spec that is a reference to the Assembly material

Anish – here is some proposed revised wording

This intent is meant to be used on an interface , and indicates that the interface is

"conversational" as defined in the SCA Assembly Specification section 1.5.3 (or whatever section

it ends up being).

Mike Rowley moves to resolve the issue with the revised wording
Anish seconds

Accepted unanimously.

Resolution: 4. Issue 8 is resolved using the wording described in the minutes.

AOB

Next meeting 5th November 2007
Close of Business