

FINAL**SCA-Policy TC Teleconference****16 June 2008****Chair**

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
fred carter	AmberPoint	Group Member
Dale Moberg	Axway Software*	Group Member
Michael Rowley	BEA Systems, Inc.	Group Member
Jacques Durand	Fujitsu Limited*	Group Member
Tom Rutt	Fujitsu Limited*	Group Member
Robert Freund	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Michael Beisiegel	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Simon Holdsworth	IBM	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ashok Malhotra	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Jeff Mischkinisky	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Kaanu Joshi	Patni Computer Systems Ltd.	Group Member
Vladislav Bezrukov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Fabian Ritzmann	Sun Microsystems	Group Member

Tai-Hsing Cha	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Pundalik Kudapkar	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG	Group Member

Contents

Resolutions.....	2
Actions	2
Agenda	3
(Item 3) Agenda Bashing	4
(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC	4
(Item 6) Action Items	5
(Item 7) New Issues	6
(Item 8) Existing Issues	6
Issue 15: External Policy Attachement	6
Issue 23 Policy attachment at the message level	6
Issue 43: Use of intents from component type in policySet algorithm.....	6
ISSUE 52: Policy algorithm gets required intents from what interfaces definitions/declarations?	7
Issue 49: Handling of Implementation Intents in the Implementation Hierarchy is not described.	7
Issue 33: The ability to express capabilities via intents.....	7
ISSUE 26: Schema validateable authorization policy	7
Issue 42: Infoset for policySet/@appliesTo.....	7
Issue 53: How do we tell what a policySet provides?	8
Issue 54: Wire validation rules have changed.....	8
(Item 9) Discuss next CD dates (target issue content).....	8
AOB	8

Resolutions

Resolution: Minutes of TC F2F meeting of 5/6th June are accepted

Resolution: Issue 43 is closed with no action: the resolution of Issue 38 fixes the problem identified by issue 43.

Actions

Action 2008-06-16-01: Ashok will do a writeup of the infoset for Issue 42

Action 2008-06-16-02: Ashok to provide a non-normative writeup which motivates the design of SCA PolicySets. (Issue 53)

Action 2008-06-16-03: Dave Booz to prepare a proposed resolution for Issue 54

Agenda

1. Roll call
2. Appointment of minute taker: Mike Edwards
3. Agenda bashing
4. Vote to accept minutes from June 5,6, 2008 meeting
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00002.html>
5. TC Logistics: any questions about TC telecons or f2f?
Next f2f meeting late Sept, early Oct.?
6. ACTION ITEMS
 - a. Action 2008-05-12-01: Mike Rowley & Mike Edwards to work on new proposal for Issue 43
 - b Action 2008-05-12-02: Mike Rowley & Mike Edwards to produce combined proposal to resolve issues 52 and 55
 - c. Mike Edwards to create description of sample policies to attach to specific places for issue 15
 - d . Ashok to send email on the WSDL URI topic
Done: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00009.html>
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00007.html>
 - e. Anish and Sanjay to write up a proposal for using External Attachment as the ONLY way to attach policies and bindings.
 - f. Ashok to write up a description for the XML structure for external attachment, issue 15
Done: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00010.html>
 - g. Action: Sanjay to raise an issue to limit policySet attachment to bindings.
 - h. Dave Booz to write replacement text to clarify that the algorithm in 4.10 is to be run for each operation and each message to close issue 27
 - i. Sanjay to write a proposal for issue 49 based on usinf External Attachment.
 - j. Dave Booz and Michael Beisiegel to work together to understand the origins of issue 26 and suggest next steps.
7. New Issues
None.
8. Issues
 - a. Issue 15 External Policy Attachment.
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-15> Recap

b. Issue 23 Policy attachment at the message level

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-23>

e. Issue 43: Use of intents from component type in policySet algorithm

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-43>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200803/msg00008.html>

f. ISSUE 52: Policy algorithm gets required intents from what interfaces definitions/declarations?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-52>

h. Issue 49: Handling of Implementation Intents in the Implementation Hierarchy is not described. We need a proposal.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-49>

i. Issue 33: The ability to express capabilities via intents.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-33>

j. ISSUE 26: Schema validateable authorization policy

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-26>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200803/msg00019.html>

k. Issue 42: Infoset for policySet/@appliesTo

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200712/msg00038.html>

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-42>

l. Issue 53: How do we tell what a policySet provides?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-53>

m. Issue 54: Wire validation rules have changed

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-54>

9. Discuss next CD dates (target issue content)

10. AOB

11. Any additions to the roll?

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

No changes

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Minutes of TC meeting of 5/6th June

Resolution: Minutes of TC F2F meeting of 5/6th June are accepted

(Item 6) Action Items

Action 2008-05-12-01: Mike Rowley & Mike Edwards to work on new proposal for Issue 43

Now reverts to Mike Edwards only. Still outstanding

Action 2008-05-12-02: Mike Rowley & Mike Edwards to produce combined proposal to resolve issues 52 and 55

Now reverts to Mike Edwards only. Still outstanding

Action 2008-06-06-01: Mike Edwards to create description of sample policies to attach to specific places for issue 15

Ashok suggests writing function signatures.

Still outstanding.

Action 2008-06-06-02: Ashok to send email on the WSDL URI topic

Done: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00009.html>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00007.html>

Done.

Action 2008-06-06-03: Anish and Sanjay to write up a proposal for using External Attachment as the ONLY way to attach policies and bindings.

Outstanding

Action 2008-06-06-04: Ashok to write up a description for the XML structure for external attachment, issue 15

Done: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00010.html>

Action 2008-06-06-05: Sanjay to raise an issue to limit policySet attachment to bindings.

Outstanding

Action 2008-06-06-06: Dave Booz to write replacement text to clarify that the algorithm in 4.10 is to be run for each operation and each message to close issue 27

Outstanding

Action 2008-06-06-07: Sanjay to write a proposal for issue 49 based on using External Attachment.

Outstanding - Sanjay is on vacation at present.

Action 2008-06-06-08: Dave Booz and Michael Beisiegel to work together to understand the origins of issue 26 and suggest next steps.

Outstanding.

(Item 7) New Issues

None

(Item 8) Existing Issues

Issue 15: External Policy Attachment

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-15>

Ashok asks the question of what do we have to do to get agreement on Issue 15
<no conclusion – there are a number of outstanding work items>

Issue 23 Policy attachment at the message level

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-23>

Mike Edwards - Do we need anything beyond the proposed external attachment mechanism?

Ashok - Currently, the SCDL works for operation level but not for message level
<no conclusion>

Issue 43: Use of intents from component type in policySet algorithm

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-43>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200803/msg00008.html>

Mike Edwards notes that the following applies after the agreed resolution of Issue 38:

A. Calculate the required intent set that applies to the target element as follows:

1. Start with the list of intents specified in the element's @requires attribute.
2. Add intents found in any related interface definition.
3. Add intents found in the inherited @requires attributes of each ancestor element in the element's structural hierarchy as defined in Rule 1 in Section 4.2.
4. Add intents found on elements below the target element in its implementation hierarchy as defined in Rule 2 in Section 4.2.
5. If the element is a binding instance and its parent element (service, reference or callback) is wired, the required intents of the other side of the wire may be added to the intent set when they are available. This may simplify, or eliminate, the policy matching step later described in step C.
6. Remove any intents that do not include the target element's type in their @constrains attribute.
7. If the set of intents includes both a qualified version of an intent and an unqualified version of the same intent, remove the unqualified version from the set.
8. If the list of intents contains a mutually exclusive pair of intents, raise an error.

....this is 4.10 following the resolution of Issue 38

Mike Edwards moves to Close Issue 43 with no action, for the reason that the resolution of Issue 38 fixes the problem identified by issue 43

Seconded by Bob Freund

Motion accepted unanimously

Resolution: Issue 43 is closed with no action: the resolution of Issue 38 fixes the problem identified by issue 43.

ISSUE 52: Policy algorithm gets required intents from what interfaces definitions/declarations?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-52>

...waiting for Mike Edwards action item

Issue 49: Handling of Implementation Intents in the Implementation Hierarchy is not described.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-49>

...waiting for Sanjay's proposal

Issue 33: The ability to express capabilities via intents.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-33>

...waiting on Dave Booz action item

ISSUE 26: Schema validateable authorization policy

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-26>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200803/msg00019.html>

...waiting on Michael Beisiegel & Dave Booz action item

Issue 42: Infoset for policySet/@appliesTo

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200712/msg00038.html>

Ashok describes Michael Rowley's proposal to use the processed infoset.

Michael Beisiegel agrees with the proposal

Mike Edwards asks what is the description of the processed infoset

Action 2008-06-16-01: Ashok will do a writeup of the infoset for Issue 42

Issue 53: How do we tell what a policySet provides?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-53>

Action 2008-06-16-02: Ashok to provide a non-normative writeup which motivates the design of SCA PolicySets. (Issue 53)

Issue 54: Wire validation rules have changed

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-54>

Action 2008-06-16-03: Dave Booz to prepare a proposed resolution for Issue 54

(Item 9) Discuss next CD dates (target issue content)

Ashok to work with the Editors on a plan.

AOB

Next meeting 23rd June
Close of Business