

FINAL**SCA-Policy TC Teleconference****11 August 2008****Chair**

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
fred carter	AmberPoint	Group Member
Dale Moberg	Axway Software*	Group Member
Robert Freund	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Simon Holdsworth	IBM	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Sanjay Patil	SAP AG*	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Fabian Ritzmann	Sun Microsystems	Group Member
Tai-Hsing Cha	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Murty Gurajada	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Pundalik Kudapkar	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member

Contents

Resolutions.....	2
Actions	2
Agenda	2
(Item 3) Agenda Bashing	4
Ashok formally requests holding off voting on Issue 15 for 2 weeks or so.	4
(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC	4
(Item 5) TC Meeting Logistics	4
(Item 6) Schedule for Work Completion	4
(Item 7) Action Items	5
(Item 7) New Issues	5
(Item 8) Existing Issues	5
Issue 15 External Policy Attachment.....	5
Issue 55 Clarify the handling of intents	6
AOB	6

Resolutions

- Resolution: Minutes of TC meeting of 28th July are accepted**
- Resolution: Policy TC meeting of Sept 1st is cancelled.**

Actions

None

Agenda

1. Roll call
2. Appointment of minute taker: Mike Edwards
3. Agenda bashing
4. Vote to accept minutes from July 28, 2008 meeting
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00045.html>
5. TC Logistics:
 - a. August 25 telecon is cancelled (UK Holiday)?
 - b. Sept 1 telecon is cancelled (US Holiday)?
 - c. Next f2f meeting Set 30, Oct 1. Hosted by Hitachi in Boston, MA
6. Schedule for completion of work
 - a. reference email sent by Dave

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200808/msg00000.html>

7. ACTION ITEMS

- a. Anish and Sanjay to write up a proposal for using External Attachment as the ONLY way to attach policies and bindings.
- b. Sanjay to write a proposal for issue 49 based on using External Attachment.
- c. Ashok to provide non-normative text to close issue 53
- d. Dave Booz to provide proposal for issue 33

8. New Issues

9. Issues

- a. Issue 15 External Policy Attachment.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-15>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00005.html>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00037.html>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00038.html>

- b. Issues 52 and 55

Policy algorithm gets required intents from what interfaces definitions/declarations?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-52>

Clarify the handling of intents

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-55>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00015.html>

- c. Issue 42: InfoSet for policySet/@appliesTo

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200712/msg00038.html>

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-42>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00021.html>

- d. Issue 23 Policy attachment at the message level

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-23>

Depends on Issue 15

- e. Remove element from specification

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-58>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00003.html>

- f. Issue 54: Wire validation rules have changed

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-54>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00017.html>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200806/msg00018.html>

- g. ISSUE 52: Policy algorithm gets required intents from what interfaces definitions/declarations?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-52>

- h. Issue 49: Handling of Implementation Intents in the Implementation Hierarchy is not described. We need a proposal.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-49>

Pending action.

i. Issue 33: The ability to express capabilities via intents.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-33>

j. Issue 53: How do we tell what a policySet provides?

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-53>

10. Discuss next CD dates (target issue content)

11. AOB

12. Any additions to the roll?

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

Ashok formally requests holding off voting on Issue 15 for 2 weeks or so.

Agreed.

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Minutes of TC meeting of 28th July

Resolution: Minutes of TC meeting of 28th July are accepted

(Item 5) TC Meeting Logistics

1) Aug 25th

Public holiday in UK

Call will go ahead as normal

2) Sept 1st

US public holiday

Bob moves to cancel the meeting of 1st Sept

Seconded by Anish

Accepted w/o

Resolution: Policy TC meeting of Sept 1st is cancelled.

3) F2F Meeting

A reminder that this meeting is planned for Oct 2/3

(Item 6) Schedule for Work Completion

Discussed in Liaison committee

One item is to raise the bar for raising new issue

Sept 15th is the suggested date for this

Other TCs have already adopted this approach

(Item 7) Action Items

- a. Anish and Sanjay to write up a proposal for using External Attachment as the ONLY way to attach policies and bindings.
- b. Sanjay to write a proposal for issue 49 based on using External Attachment.
- c. Ashok to provide non-normative text to close issue 53
- d. Dave Booz to provide proposal for issue 33

Some progress, but all items are outstanding.

(Item 7) New Issues

None

(Item 8) Existing Issues

Issue 15 External Policy Attachment.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-15>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00005.html>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00037.html>

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00038.html>

Issue15_Alternative_Proposal_03.doc

Ashok discusses an aspect of the proposal relating to @appliesTo.

There is a need to improve the current spec wording relating to @appliesTo (nothing to do with current proposal!) - relating to the removal of the "pull" mechanism (line 145 etc) - how would this apply to "general corporate policies"?

Dave B: I look at this a bit differently. Intents are still matched to PolicySets, since the XPath expression in @attachTo can be set to include one or more intents as part of its selection of Policies.

Ashok: You have to write the application XPath as well as the PolicySet

Sanjay: Does the current proposal remove the @provides attribute of policySets?

To answer Sanjay: No, @provides is still there

Sanjay: Then wouldn't we have two mechanisms for push now - a> via policySet@provides and b> via ExternalAttachment@appliesTo

Dave B: You are making a good observation in that @provides could be optional - it isn't strictly required for the application of the policySet to an artifact

Sanjay: if we get rid of the pull mechanism we should revisit all parts of the specification that relate to it and clean them up

Ashok: At the end of the proposal there are some functions - the functions don't quite work right, when we're working with WSDL interfaces. We need examples which show a particular binding with a particular operation or message in the WSDL file
(Mike E and Ashok can talk offline about this)

Mike E asks if there is agreement on the general direction in the proposal since the next step is preparation of an updated spec draft - a load of work

Sanjay: I like the proposal overall
SAP would prefer to attach policies in this way
Bob: I'm generally in favour

Issue 55 Clarify the handling of intents

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-55>
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200807/msg00015.html>

There is a proposal: sca-policy-1.1-spec-wd-06_Issue52_Proposal.doc
This also resolves Issue 52 - Policy algorithm gets required intents from what interfaces definitions/declarations?

Starts with Section 4.2.1 - line 781
Mike E explains how the proposal is structured
We will look at this proposal in depth next week.

AOB

Next meeting 11th Aug
Close of Business