

FINAL**SCA-Policy TC Teleconference****09 February 2009****Chairs**

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
fred carter	AmberPoint	Group Member
Dale Moberg	Axway Software*	Group Member
Jacques Durand	Fujitsu Limited*	Group Member
Robert Freund	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Michael Beisiegel	IBM	Group Member
David Booz	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Simon Holdsworth	IBM	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ashok Malhotra	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Fabian Ritzmann	Sun Microsystems	Group Member
Tai-Hsing Cha	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Murty Gurajada	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member

Contents

Resolutions.....	2
Actions	2
Agenda	2
(Item 3) Agenda Bashing	4
(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC	4
(Item 5) TC Logistics.....	4
(Item 6) Action Items.....	4
(Item 7) New Issues	5
ISSUE-68: Authorization Policy language should be optional.....	5
ISSUE-69: Change the normative meaning of Assertion POL40006.....	5
ISSUE-70: Change Section 9.6.3 to be non-normative	5
(Item 8) Existing Issues	6
ISSUE-62: RFC2119 text updates	6
ISSUE 57: Fine grain authorization intent.....	6
Issue Status Reporting - for Liaison Committee.....	7
AOB	7

Resolutions

**Resolution: Minutes of Policy TC F2F meeting of Jan 28/29
are accepted**

Resolution: Issue 68 is opened.

Resolution: Issue 69 is opened

Resolution: Issue 70 is opened

Resolution: Issue 62 is resolved

**Resolution: Motion to resolve Issue 57 is tabled until 16th
Feb**

Actions

None

Agenda

1. Roll call

2. Confirm minute taker

3. Agenda bashing

4. Meeting Minutes

Vote to accept minutes from F2F JAN 28-29 2009

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00069.html>

5. TC Logistics:

- a. Recording issue status - 2 Open

6. ACTION ITEMS

- a. 20081124-01: Rich L & Ashok - Build the detailed proposal for the resolution of Issue 57

DONE

- b. 20090105-01: Dave B to write up spec text for Issue 33 based on latest proposal

DONE

- c. 20090128-01: (Rich) Fix the example in 7.3.2 to add the appropriate namespace

- d. 20090128-02: (Rich) Add a fineGrain intent - have the policySet provide this intent and then have the XACML inline within the policySet

- e. 20090128-23: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Change copyright statements in XSD & XML files to 2005, 2009

- f. 20090128-24: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Need to add the name of the definitions XML file at the top of Appendix B

- g. 20090128-25: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Add blank lines between groups of intents in Appendix B

- h. 20090128-26: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Remove RFC 2119 words from Appendix B

- i. 20090128-27: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Add pointers to the new appendix B from the sections of the spec that normatively describe the Intents

- j. 20090128-30: (Eric) Check the meaning of "applies" and determine if the spec needs a statement added relating to its meaning

7. New Issues

- a. ISSUE-68: Authorization Policy language should be optional

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-68>

Proposal: in the JIRA

- b. ISSUE-69: Change the normative meaning of Assertion POL40006

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-69>

Proposal: in the JIRA

- c. ISSUE-70: Change Section 9.6.3 to be non-normative

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-70>

Proposal: in the JIRA

8. Issue Discussion

- a. ISSUE-62: RFC2119 text updates

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-62>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200902/msg00025.html>

- b. ISSUE 57: Fine grain authorization intent

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-57>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200902/msg00028.html>

c. ISSUE 64: Policy Specification is missing formal definitions of the various Intents
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-64>
Proposal:

9. Testing Discussion

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00045.html>

10. AOB

a. straggler roll

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

No changes

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Vote to accept minutes from F2F JAN 28-29 2009

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00069.html>

Minutes are accepted without changes

**Resolution: Minutes of Policy TC F2F meeting of Jan 28/29
are accepted**

(Item 5) TC Logistics

(Item 6) Action Items

a. 20081124-01: Rich L & Ashok - Build the detailed proposal for the resolution of Issue 57

DONE

b. 20090105-01: Dave B to write up spec text for Issue 33 based on latest proposal

DONE

c. 20090128-01: (Rich) Fix the example in 7.3.2 to add the appropriate namespace

DONE

d. 20090128-02: (Rich) Add a fineGrain intent - have the policySet provide this intent and then have the XACML inline within the policySet

DONE

e. 20090128-23: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Change copyright statements in XSD & XML files to 2005, 2009

f. 20090128-24: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Need to add the name of the definitions XML file at the top of Appendix B

g. 20090128-25: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Add blank lines between groups of intents in Appendix B

h. 20090128-26: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Remove RFC 2119 words from Appendix B

- i. 20090128-27: (Mike E) Issue 64 - Add pointers to the new appendix B from the sections of the spec that normatively describe the Intents
- j. 20090128-30: (Eric) Check the meaning of "applies" and determine if the spec needs a statement added relating to its
DONE

(Item 7) New Issues

ISSUE-68: Authorization Policy language should be optional

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-68>

Proposal: in the JIRA

Dave outlines the issue

Rich: I had a problem with this area when looking at the proposal for Issue 57 as there is no intent based material for this section

Dave moves to open Issue 68.

Mike E seconds

Rich: Questions whether it needs to be opened given the proposal for Issue 57

Ashok points out that if the proposal for 57 is accepted then it would have the effect of resolving this issue too.

Accepted unanimously

Resolution: Issue 68 is opened.

ISSUE-69: Change the normative meaning of Assertion POL40006

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-69>

Proposal: in the JIRA

Mike E describes the issue

Ashok: I'm a bit nervous about this - if a PolicySet is put on the component inadvertently, then all the componentType information is obliterated

Mike E moves to open Issue 69

Dave B seconds

Accepted unanimously.

Resolution: Issue 69 is opened

ISSUE-70: Change Section 9.6.3 to be non-normative

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-70>

Proposal: in the JIRA

Mike E describes the issue

Mike E moves to open Issue 70

Dave B seconds

Accepted unanimously

Resolution: **Issue 70 is opened**

(Item 8) Existing Issues

ISSUE-62: RFC2119 text updates

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-62>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200902/msg00025.html>

sca-policy-1.1-spec-CD01-Rev13g.doc - is the proposed document

Dave B describes the origins of this document from the work at the F2F - also includes Martin C's proposal for the Conformance section

Want this document to be accepted - build Rev14 from it and use as the basis for folding in further issue resolutions

Dave B moves to accept sca-policy-1.1-spec-CD01-Rev13g.doc as the resolution of Issue 62

Eric seconds

Accepted unanimously

Resolution: **Issue 62 is resolved**

ISSUE 57: Fine grain authorization intent

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-57>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200902/msg00028.html>

Ashok outlines the issue and the proposal

Criticizes the current spec as in the authorization part it defines concrete policies in a some off-the-wall policy language

So the proposal steps back and looks to address this area of function using intents instead

Dave: The mini-language resulted from trying to deal with authorization with intents proved very hard - roles can't be represented as intents

Dave: I found these new intents in the proposal a surprise - why are they there?

Ashok: Well, if we take out the authorization impl language then we found these intents seemed useful to capture the basic function that the policy language captured

Dave: So what do we do with these other new qualifiers - do they get mapped to a policy set or are they useful on their own (like transaction intents)

Rich: State the requirements that the app has on the runtime

Mike E: Could I envisage the existence of a policySet written in eg XACML which configures the runtime in detail?

Ashok: eg authorization.role - would it be implemented natively or would it require a policySet?

Rich - I'd envisage a policySet being present

Mike E: These detailed intents are of different kinds

- usecallerIdentity and propagateCallerIdentity are like the transactional propagatesTransaction intent - relate to bindings

- finegrain is an intent aimed at the runtime container

- denyaccessbias is a bit strange in that it requires some other intents down at the method level to counteract it

<discussion of how denyaccessbias intent fits into the model>

Dave: We can probably agree authorization intent + finegrain qualifier

Rich- I'd recommend accepting it with authorization + finegrain

Mike E: But this also involves removing the existing policySet material

Dave: I'd prefer to do that removal under the other issue we opened today (Issue 67)

Ashok: I'd prefer to remove it with this issue

Ashok: Accept the proposal for Issue 57 with only authorization intent + finegrain qualifier and removing the other 3 qualifiers and also removing the Security Policy assertion material (end of section 7)

Rich seconds

Bob: move to defer until next week

Mike E moves to table the motion until next week

Ashok seconds

Motion to table is accepted

Resolution: Motion to resolve Issue 57 is tabled until 16th Feb

Issue Status Reporting - for Liaison Committee

4 open issues

3 opened today

1 closed today

AOB

Next meeting 16th Feb

Close of Business