FINAL

SCA-Policy TC Teleconference

4 January 2010

Chairs

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
David Booz	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Simon Holdsworth	IBM	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ashok Malhotra	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Jeff Mischkinsky	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Gilbert Pilz	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Murty Gurajada	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member

Table of Contents

Resolutions

Minutes of Policy TC meeting of December 14th are accepted

Issue 114 is opened

Issue 114 is resolved

Issue 115 is opened

Issue 115 is resolved

Issue 79 is re-opened

Actions

ACTION 20100104-01: (Editors) Fix the name of the file in Appendix B1 to match the actual name of the file.
ACTION 20100104-02: Ashok to prepare a revised proposal for Issue 79

Agenda

```
1. Roll call

2. Confirm minute taker

3. Agenda bashing

4. Meeting Minutes
Vote to accept minutes from Dec 14 2009
- http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35596/SCA%20Policy
%20minutes%202009-12-14.pdf

5. TC Administrivia:
```

a. Recording issue status - 3 Open

6. PRD status update
a. 9 issues from PR 01 comment list that still need responses (Dave)

7. ACTION ITEMS:
a. 20091019-02: owner=AshokM status=pending Write detailed proposal for POLICY-93
b. 20091214-01: owner=editors status=pending correct typo in the caption title for snippet 4-21 "woth" instead of "with"
c. 20091214-02: owner=Dave status=pending Upgrade candidate CD03 to the new Assembly namespace

8. New Issues
a. ISSUE 114: IntentQualifier Element in Policy XSD has no extensibility
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-114

b. ISSUE 115: Policy Specification has incorrect examples for the @appliesTo attribute of PolicySet
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-115

9. Blocking Issue Discussion
None

10. Additional Issue Discussion
a. ISSUE 93: Allow external attachment for intents
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-93
proposal: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200911/msg00002.html
latest: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200912/msg00006.html

b. ISSUE 110: Should intents be ignorablel?
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-110
Discussion:
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200912/msg00013.html
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00000.html

c. ISSUE 111: Asynch methods and Transactions
http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-111
Discussion:
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200912/msg00013.html
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200912/msg00036.html

11. Testing
a. Test Status:
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200911/msg00047.html

- Test Assertion Document:
DOC: http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35139/SCA-Policy-1.1-Test-Assertions-WD-05.doc
PDF: http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35138/SCA-Policy-1.1-Test-Assertions-WD-05.pdf

- Test Case Documents

```
ODT: http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35141/sca-
policy-1.1-testcases-wd02.odt
PDF: http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35140/sca-
policy-1.1-testcases-wd02.pdf

- Testcase code:
http://tools.oasis-open.org/version-control/svn/sca-policy/TestCases/

12. AOB
a. straggler roll
```

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

Ashok: Dave - you sent out mail about taking out the bindings from definitions - there is a typo in that
Ashok: I have not completed work on Issue 93, so prefer to postpone that until next week

Dave: Deal with the first one under "Action Items". Second one means we can't deal with Issue 93 today.

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Minutes from 14th December 2009
Minutes approved without change

Resolution: Minutes of Policy TC meeting of December 14th are accepted

(Item 5) TC Administrivia

3 open issues

(Item 6) PRD Status

9 issues from PR 01 comment list that still need responses (Dave)

(Item 7) Action Items

a. 20091019-02: owner=AshokM status=pending Write detailed proposal for POLICY-93
b. 20091214-01: owner=editors status=pending correct typo in the caption title for snippet 4-21 "woth" instead of "with"
c. 20091214-02: owner=Dave status=pending Upgrade candidate CD03 to the new Assembly namespace

Ashok: Item relating to appendix B1, 1st line says "intent definitions are contained within a definitions file called policy_intents"
Dave: policy intent definitions file name: sca-policy-1.1-intents-definitions-cd03.xml
Ashok: I want it made clear that this file has a particular name and is an ancillary file which accompanies the specification

ACTION 20100104-01: (Editors) Fix the name of the file in Appendix B1 to match the actual name of the file.

(Item 8) New Issues

ISSUE 114: IntentQualifier Element in Policy XSD has no extensibility

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-114

Mike E introduces the issue

Mike moves to open issue 114
Ashok seconds
Motion passes unanimously

<p style="color:red; font-weight:bold; text-align:center">Resolution: Issue 114 is opened</p>

Discussion of a proposal for Issue 114
Ashok: Don't you want an <anyAttribute> extension as well?
Mike: Don't see why not

Mike E moves to resolve Issue 114 by adding
a) <any namespace="##other" processContents="lax" minOccurs="0" maxOccurs="unbounded"/>
at the end of the sequence in the IntentQualifier definition.
b) <anyAttribute namespace="##other" processContents="lax"/>
at the end of the IntentQualifier definition
Ashok seconds
Motion passes unanimouslyIssue 114 is resolved

<p style="color:red; font-weight:bold; text-align:center">Resolution: Issue 114 is resolved</p>

ISSUE 115: Policy Specification has incorrect examples for the @appliesTo attribute of PolicySet

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-115

Mike E explains the issue
@appliesTo examples are wrong
Mike moves to open issue 115
Ashok seconds
Motion passes unanimously

<p style="color:red; font-weight:bold; text-align:center">Resolution: Issue 115 is opened</p>

Mike E discusses a proposal for 115
- change all examples of @appliesTo to start with "//"

Mike E moves to resolve Issue 115 with the proposal in the JIRA

Ashok seconds
Motion passes unanimously

Resolution: Issue 115 is resolved

(Item 10) Open Issues

ISSUE 110: Should intents be ignorablel?

http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-110
Discussion:
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200912/msg00013.html
http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00000.html

Ashok discusses his email (last link above) - suggestion that intent can be made explicitly optional
Anish - I really dont think that the SHOULD wording is good since it undermines the model. I think it should be a MUST - SHOULD demolishes portability

Dave - this is really the resolution of Issue 79
Anish is suggesting the reopening of Issue 79

Mike: I agree with Anish
Dave: I also agree with Anish

Ashok: Should we revisit 79 or simply deal with the wording under 110
Ashok: My mail had a specific proposal to enable marking of intents with "Ignorable" or "NotIgnorable"
Mike: I think that makes the model more complex just to avoid making a decision

Mike: Do people object to the idea of changing the normative statement to a "MUST"?

Eric moves to reopen Issue 79
Mike E seconds
Motion passes unanimously - with 2/3 quorum, as required for a re-open motion.

Resolution: Issue 79 is re-opened

ACTION 20100104-02: Ashok to prepare a revised proposal for Issue 79

<Discussion of Issue 111 and the lastest email exchanges>
Go through Issue 111 at meeting next week.

AOB

Next meeting 11 January

Close of Business