

FINAL**SCA-Policy TC Teleconference****25 January 2010****Chairs**

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
David Booz	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ashok Malhotra	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Jeff Mischkinsky	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Fabian Ritzmann	Sun Microsystems	Group Member
Tai-Hsing Cha	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Murty Gurajada	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Pundalik Kudapkar	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member

Table of Contents

Resolutions.....	2
Actions.....	2
Agenda.....	2
(Item 3) Agenda Bashing.....	3
(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC.....	3
(Item 5) TC Administrivia.....	3
(Item 6) PRD Status.....	4
(Item 7) Action Items.....	4
(Item 8) New Issues.....	4
(Item 10) Open Issues.....	4
ISSUE 93: Allow external attachment for intents	4
AOB.....	5

Resolutions

Minutes of Policy TC meeting of January 18th are accepted
Issue 93 is resolved along the lines of the proposal contained in
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00023.html>

Actions

ACTION 20100125-01: Ashok will raise a new issue on the subject of the realignment of external and internal attachment of policySets

Agenda

1. Roll call
2. Confirm minute taker
3. Agenda bashing
4. Meeting Minutes
Vote to accept minutes from Jan 18 2009
- <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35977/SCA%20Policy%20minutes%202010-01-18.pdf>
5. TC Administrivia:
 - a. Recording issue status - 1 Open
6. PRD status update
 - a. 9 issues from PR 01 comment list that still need responses (Dave)
7. ACTION ITEMS:
 - a. 20091214-01: owner=editors status=done correct typo in the caption title for snippet 4-21 "woth" instead of "with"

- b. 20091214-02: owner=Dave status=done Upgrade candidate CD03 to the new Assembly namespace
- c. 20100104-01: owner=editors status=pending Fix the name of the file in Appendix B1 to match the actual name of the file.

8. New Issues

None

9. Blocking Issue Discussion

None

10. Additional Issue Discussion

- a. ISSUE 93: Allow external attachment for intents
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-93>
proposal: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00023.html>

11. Testing

- a. Test Status:
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200911/msg00047.html>

- Test Assertion Document:

DOC: <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35139/SCA-Policy-1.1-Test-Assertions-WD-05.doc>

PDF: <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35138/SCA-Policy-1.1-Test-Assertions-WD-05.pdf>

- Test Case Documents

ODT: <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35141/sca-policy-1.1-testcases-wd02.odt>

PDF: <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/35140/sca-policy-1.1-testcases-wd02.pdf>

- Testcase code:

<http://tools.oasis-open.org/version-control/svn/sca-policy/TestCases/>

12. AOB

- a. straggler roll

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

No changes

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Minutes from 18th January 2010

Minutes approved without change

**Resolution: Minutes of Policy TC meeting of January 18th
are accepted**

(Item 5) TC Administrivia

1 open issue

(Item 6) PRD Status

9 issues from PR 01 comment list that still need responses (Dave)

(Item 7) Action Items

- a. 20091214-01: owner=editors status=done correct typo in the caption title for snippet 4-21 "woth" instead of "with"
- b. 20091214-02: owner=Dave status=done Upgrade candidate CD03 to the new Assembly namespace
- c. 20100104-01: owner=editors status=pending Fix the name of the file in Appendix B1 to match the actual name of the file.

(Item 8) New Issues

None

(Item 10) Open Issues

IISSUE 93: Allow external attachment for intents

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-93>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00023.html>

Ashok discusses the email changes that have taken place since the last meeting

1) 1st the question about treating external attached intents as either/or - alternative of simply adding intents together

- new proposal with this change has been posted

- change is in section 4.1

2) Dave Booz asked for clarification of usecases

- Ashok supplied some usecases

- ability to change requirements based on a new deployment to a new environment

- Dave B made the point that the proposal means using intents to express "external" requirements, whereas the current spec specifies "internal" requirements using intents

- This makes the differences in thinking clear

Mike E - I see this proposal as essentially being a means of supplying deployment information - and that this can be done using the deployment of appropriate PolicySets with attachment specifications to the appropriate locations

Ashok: Our proposal is to allow expression of external requirements that can then be satisfied with appropriate concrete policies - it is a useful extension of the function that is present

Rich: This has similarity to defining intents at a higher level versus a lower level and where lower levels can express more detailed requirements (eg qualified intents) and the intents are separated from the actual policies that are used

Ashok moves to resolve Issue 93 along the lines of the proposal contained in
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00023.html>
Gil seconds

Eric - we should tidy up the external/internal attachment mechanism - I don't like them being exclusive

Ashok, agree, but that is a separate issue

Mike: Currently external attachment of policies is an override, which is different

Eric: Isn't it the case that some people would not want a directly attached policySet to be overridden

Mike: Current mechanism does not support that - you could envisage a new design that provided that capability

Vote on the motion:

10 = Yes

2 = No

Resolution: Issue 93 is resolved along the lines of the proposal contained in <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/201001/msg00023.html>

<Discussion of an issue to realign external & internal attachment of Policy sets>

ACTION 20100125-01: Ashok will raise a new issue on the subject of the realignment of external and internal attachment of policySets

Mike E will write an email once that issue is raised - propose to remove direct attachment of policySets

AOB

Next meeting 25 January

Close of Business