

Publication: DITAweb: Review A (00811081-DC_1)

Topic: abstract (DA00509283)

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The <abstract> element is designed for use when the initial paragraph of a topic is unsuitable as a link preview or hover text:

- It contains lists, tables, or other block-level elements.
- Only a portion of the content is suitable for a link preview
- It contains multiple short descriptions.

When the initial paragraph is suitable as a link preview, simply place the content in a <shortdesc> element rather than in an <abstract> element.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
The 2nd list item needs to end in a period, since at least one list item is a complete sentence. (IBM Style Guidelines)	keberlein	updated	comment	11/11/2021 17:24:18	
Fixed. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 19:43:59	

Usage information

The <abstract> element is designed for use when the initial paragraph of a topic is unsuitable as a link preview or hover text:

- It contains lists, tables, or other block-level elements.
- Only a portion of the content is suitable for a link preview
- It contains multiple short descriptions.

When the initial paragraph is suitable as a link preview, simply place the content in a <shortdesc> element rather than in an <abstract> element.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
I keep my <shortdesc> content very brief, so I use <abstract> to provide more expanded summary information about a topic. I see it as morethan a fallback for anemic short descriptions.	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 20:57:22	

Stan, is this a general observation, or are you suggesting a specific change to the topic? If the latter, what change are you suggesting?

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021 18:20:35

Sent e-mail to Stan, but have not heard back. Marking this comment as **CLOSED**.

Usage information

The <abstract> element is designed for use when the initial paragraph of a topic is unsuitable as a link preview or hover text:

- It contains lists, tables, or other block-level elements.
- Only a portion of the content is suitable for a link preview
- It contains multiple short descriptions.

When the initial paragraph is suitable as a link preview, simply place the content in a <shortdesc> element rather than in an <abstract> element.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Are we saying that the initial paragraph of the topic is unsuitable because it is described by the 3 bullet points, or is it that the abstract is described by the 3 bullet points? Not which from reading it which is meant.	nharrison	updated	comment	16/11/2021 06:10:00	
Changed to read as follows: "The abstract element is designed for use when the initial paragraph of a topic is unsuitable as a link preview or hover text. This might occur in the following circumstances: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The initial paragraph contains lists, tables, or other block-level elements.• Only a portion of the content of the initial paragraph is suitable for a link preview.• The initial paragraph contains multiple short descriptions.	keberlein	updated	comment	17/11/2021 11:45:37	

Revised this once again to read as follows: "The abstract element is designed for use in the following circumstances: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The initial paragraph of a topic contains lists, tables, or other block-level elements that are not permitted					

in the content model of shortdesc .

- Only a portion of the content of the initial paragraph is suitable for a link preview or hover text.
- A topic needs to contain multiple short descriptions, to facilitate conditional processing."

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Rendering expectations

When a contained `<shortdesc>` occurs within phrase-level content, processors treat it as phrase-level content and do not create a separate paragraph when the topic is rendered. When the contained `<shortdesc>` occurs as a peer to paragraph-level content, processors treat it as block-level content and create a separate paragraph when the topic is rendered. When multiple `<shortdesc>` elements are included in an `<abstract>`, they are concatenated when used for link previews or or link summaries (separated by spaces).

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Rendering expectationsWhen a contained occurs within phrase-level content, processors treat it as phrase-level content and do not create a separate paragraph when the topic is rendered. When the contained occurs as a peer to paragraph-level content, processors treat it as block-level content and create a separate paragraph when the topic is rendered. When multiple elements are included in an , they are concatenated when used for link previews or or link summaries , (separated by spaces).	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 13:05:18	
Fixed; thanks for catching this. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 15:49:25	

Examples

This section contains examples of how the `<abstract>` element can be used.

`<abstract>` with phrase-level short description

The following code sample shows how an `<abstract>` element that contains phrase-level content in addition to a short description:

```
<abstract>
  <shortdesc>Use the wonderful Widget to automatically vacuum your house.
</shortdesc> It requires a 1800 lithium ion battery.
</abstract>
```

While the complete content of the <abstract> element is rendered as the first paragraph of the topic, only the content of the <shortdesc> element is used for a link preview and hover text.

<abstract> with block-level short description

The following code sample shows an <abstract> element that contains block-level content, in addition to a short description:

```
<abstract>
  <shortdesc>You have many options for arranging lodging in Brussels
  hotels, bed and breakfasts, youth hostels, and flats. You can select
  from a wide price range.</shortdesc>
  <p>The following table explains the symbols that are used to indicate the price
  categories of the lodging options:</p>
  <simpletable>
  <! -- ... -->
  </simpletable>
</abstract>
```

<abstract> with multiple short descriptions

The following code sample shows an <abstract> element that contains multiple short descriptions, which will be filtered when the topic is processed:

```
<abstract>
  <shortdesc platform="free-version">The free version of the platform
  provides a single e-mail list, storage for up to one gigabyte of
  files, and will support up to 100 users.</shortdesc>
  <shortdesc platform="premium-version">The premium version of the platform
  provides multiple e-mails lists, storage for up to 30 gigabytes of
  fules, and will support up to 400 users.</shortdesc>
</abstract>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
ExamplesThis section contains examples of how the element can be used. with phrase-level short descriptionThe following code sample shows how an element that contains phrase-level content in addition to a short description: Use the wonderful Widget to automatically vacuum your house. It requires a 1800 lithium ion battery.While the complete content of the element is rendered as the first paragraph of the topic, only the content of the element is used for a link preview and hover text. with block-level short descriptionThe following code sample shows an element that contains block-level content, in addition to a short description: You have many options for arranging lodging in Brussels — , including hotels, bed and breakfasts, youth hostels, and flats. You can select from a wide price range.	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 13:13:25	
The following table explains the symbols that are used to indicate the price categories of the lodging options:					

<! -- ... --> with multiple short descriptionsThe following code sample shows an element that contains multiple short descriptions, which will be filtered when the topic is processed: The free version of the platform provides a single e-mail list, storage for up to one gigabyte of files, and will support up to 100 users. The premium version of the platform provides multiple e-mail s lists, storage for up to 30 gigabytes of f + files, and will support up to 400 users.

Fixed; thanks for catching the errors.

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021 15:52:17

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <abstract> element can be used.

<abstract> with phrase-level short description

The following code sample shows how an <abstract> element that contains phrase-level content in addition to a short description:

```
<abstract>
  <shortdesc>Use the wonderful Widget to automatically vacuum your house.
</shortdesc> It requires a 1800 lithium ion battery.
</abstract>
```

While the complete content of the <abstract> element is rendered as the first paragraph of the topic, only the content of the <shortdesc> element is used for a link preview and hover text.

<abstract> with block-level short description

The following code sample shows an <abstract> element that contains block-level content, in addition to a short description:

```
<abstract>
  <shortdesc>You have many options for arranging lodging in Brussels
hotels, bed and breakfasts, youth hostels, and flats. You can select
from a wide price range.</shortdesc>
  <p>The following table explains the symbols that are used to indicate the price
categories of the lodging options:</p>
  <simpletable>
  <! -- ... -->
  </simpletable>
</abstract>
```

<abstract> with multiple short descriptions

The following code sample shows an <abstract> element that contains multiple short descriptions, which will be filtered when the topic is processed:

```

<abstract>
  <shortdesc platform="free-version">The free version of the platform
  provides a single e-mail list, storage for up to one gigabyte of
  files, and will support up to 100 users.</shortdesc>
  <shortdesc platform="premium-version">The premium version of the platform
  provides multiple e-mails lists, storage for up to 30 gigabytes of
  fules, and will support up to 400 users.</shortdesc>
</abstract>

```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
<p>Examples This section contains examples of how the element can be used. with phrase-level short description The following code sample shows how an element that contains phrase-level content in addition to a short description: Use the wonderful Widget to automatically vacuum your house. It requires a 1800 lithium ion battery. While the complete content of the element is rendered as the first paragraph of the topic, only the content of the element is used for a link preview and hover text. with block-level short description The following code sample shows an element that contains block-level content, in addition to a short description: You have many options for arranging lodging in Brussels hotels, bed and breakfasts, youth hostels, and flats. You can select from a wide price range.</p> <p>The following table explains the symbols that are used to indicate the price categories of the lodging options:</p> <p>&lt;! -- ... --> with multiple short descriptions The following code sample shows an element that contains multiple short descriptions, which will be filtered when the topic is processed: The free version of the platform provides a single e-mail list, storage for up to one gigabyte of files, and will support up to 100 users. The premium version of the platform provides multiple e-mails lists, storage for up to 30 gigabytes of fules, and will support up to 400 users.</p>	cbrennecke	updated	change	15/11/2021 18:03:12	
<p>Done; thanks for catching this!</p> <p>Marking this comment as COMPLETED.</p>	keberlein	updated	comment	15/11/2021 18:28:49	

Topic: titlealt (DC00811031)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
------------	----------	--------	------	------	---------------

Is it worth having an example with a map and a topic and showing expectations? Or does that belong over in the architecture area?

zlawson updated comment 14/11/2021 02:27:15

Do we want to have a related link to the Alternative-titles domain? Should the various @title-role values reference the appropriate element? (The elements reference titlealt)

1. More complex examples are handled in the archSpec.
2. I have added a reliable link to the "Alternate titles domain" topic
3. Not sure about having names of the elements in the alternate titles domain; Robert?

Robert and I finally got the opportunity to discuss this today. While I could not find a way to mention the names of the alternative-title domain elements in the "Processing expectations" section -- It just did not feel right -- I did do the following:

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021 16:03:30

- Modified the examples to mention the comparable markup if the alternative-titles domain is available.
- Made some tweaks to the "Usage information" section, so that the info about the alternative-titles domain was in a standalone paragraph.

Hopefully this helps ...

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Paragraph-level comments

Usage Information

Alternative titles can be used in both maps and topics:

- When used in the <topicmeta> of a root <map> element, the alternative title applies to the map itself.
- When used inside a <topicref>, the alternative title applies to the resource referenced by the <topicref>.
- When the referenced resource is a DITA topic, the alternative titles from the <topicref> are merged with those authored directly in the topic, with the alternative titles from the <topicref> taking higher priority.

The roles of an alternative title are specified by the @title-role attribute. Multiple roles can be specified, separated by white space. An alternative title specifies at least one role.

Other tokens for the @title-role attribute can be defined by for specific purposes. The base DITA vocabulary contains an alternative titles domain that contains convenience elements that are equivalent to <titlealt> elements with the @title-role attribute set to the tokens outlined below.

Some roles might not be meaningful in certain contexts. For example, a navigational alternate title is not meaningful in the context of a <topicgroup> element, since the element is not part of the navigation structural of a publication. Such alternate titles are ignored by processors.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Is @title-role optional?					
If I specify no @title-role, what is the default behavior?	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:12:08	
Yes, the title-role attribute is required.					
Marking this comment as CLOSED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 19:54:11	

Usage Information

Alternative titles can be used in both maps and topics:

- When used in the <topicmeta> of a root <map> element, the alternative title applies to the map itself.
- When used inside a <topicref>, the alternative title applies to the resource referenced by the <topicref>.
- When the referenced resource is a DITA topic, the alternative titles from the <topicref> are merged with those authored directly in the topic, with the alternative titles from the <topicref> taking higher priority.

The roles of an alternative title are specified by the @title-role attribute. Multiple roles can be specified, separated by white space. An alternative title specifies at least one role.

Other tokens for the @title-role attribute can be defined by for specific purposes. The base DITA vocabulary contains an alternative titles domain that contains convenience elements that are equivalent to <titlealt> elements with the @title-role attribute set to the tokens outlined below.

Some roles might not be meaningful in certain contexts. For example, a navigational alternate title is not meaningful in the context of a <topicgroup> element, since the element is not part of the navigation structural of a publication. Such alternate titles are ignored by processors.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Regarding this sentence:					
An alternative title specifies at least one role					
Should we make this SHOULD or MUST? I think it should be MUST, though from a spec perspective SHOULD may be good enough here...	gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 14:54:17	
No -- we do not use normative language to talk about things that are enforced by the grammar files. The @title-role attribute is required.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:05:53	

Marking this comment as **CLOSED**.

Usage Information

Alternative titles can be used in both maps and topics:

- When used in the <topicmeta> of a root <map> element, the alternative title applies to the map itself.
- When used inside a <topicref>, the alternative title applies to the resource referenced by the <topicref>.
- When the referenced resource is a DITA topic, the alternative titles from the <topicref> are merged with those authored directly in the topic, with the alternative titles from the <topicref> taking higher priority.

The roles of an alternative title are specified by the @title-role attribute. Multiple roles can be specified, separated by white space. An alternative title specifies at least one role.

Other tokens for the @title-role attribute can be defined by for specific purposes. The base DITA vocabulary contains an alternative titles domain that contains convenience elements that are equivalent to <titlealt> elements with the @title-role attribute set to the tokens outlined below.

Some roles might not be meaningful in certain contexts. For example, a navigational alternate title is not meaningful in the context of a <topicgroup> element, since the element is not part of the navigation structural of a publication. Such alternate titles are ignored by processors.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Usage Information Alternative titles can be used in both maps and topics: When used in the of a root element, the alternative title applies to the map itself. When used inside a , the alternative title applies to the resource referenced by the . When the referenced resource is a DITA topic, the alternative titles from the are merged with those authored directly in the topic, with the alternative titles from the taking higher priority. The roles of an alternative title are specified by the @title-role attribute. Multiple roles can be specified, separated by white space. An alternative title specifies at least one role. Other tokens for the @title-role attribute can be defined by for specific purposes. The base DITA vocabulary contains an alternative titles domain that contains convenience elements that are equivalent to elements with the @title-role attribute set to the tokens outlined below. Some roles might not be meaningful in certain contexts. For example, a navigational alternate title is not meaningful in the context of a element, since the element is not part of the navigation structural structure of a publication. Such alternate titles are ignored by processors.	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 15:00:34	
Fixed; thanks for catching these errors.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:09:17	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Usage Information

Alternative titles can be used in both maps and topics:

- When used in the <topicmeta> of a root <map> element, the alternative title applies to the map itself.
- When used inside a <topicref>, the alternative title applies to the resource referenced by the <topicref>.
- When the referenced resource is a DITA topic, the alternative titles from the <topicref> are merged with those authored directly in the topic, with the alternative titles from the <topicref> taking higher priority.

The roles of an alternative title are specified by the @title-role attribute. Multiple roles can be specified, separated by white space. An alternative title specifies at least one role.

Other tokens for the @title-role attribute can be defined by for specific purposes. The base DITA vocabulary contains an alternative titles domain that contains convenience elements that are equivalent to <titlealt> elements with the @title-role attribute set to the tokens outlined below.

Some roles might not be meaningful in certain contexts. For example, a navigational alternate title is not meaningful in the context of a <topicgroup> element, since the element is not part of the navigation structural of a publication. Such alternate titles are ignored by processors.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
should the note on processors ignoring the element in certain situations be in usage info, or in processing expectations?	nharrison	updated	comment	16/11/2021 06:43:41	
The "Processing expectations" section does cover this thoroughly.	keberlein	updated	comment	20/11/2021 17:41:25	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Processing expectations

Draft comment: robander 13 May 2021

Questions as I read this more closely:

Some of this language implies a specific type of processor, which we've had trouble with in the past; language may need to be more processor agnostic

Given the complications, the number of required samples, and the impact on processing, it feels like this deserves a page in the architectural specification.

The processing of an alternative title depends on its roles. Processors *SHOULD* support the following tokens for the @title-role attribute:

linking

Specifies that the content of the <titlealt> element contains the title for use in references to the resources generated from DITA map structures, such as hierarchical parent/child/sibling links and links generated from relationship tables. In addition, this is the fallback alternative title for navigation and search roles. Custom title roles meant for use in link generation also should use this as a fallback.

navigation

Specifies that the content of the <titlealt> element contains the title for use in tables of content and other navigation aids. In some cases, when processing a <topicref> that has no @href, this also is used as the title of the generated pseudo-topic, if applicable. If not present, this role is fulfilled by the linking role.

search

Specifies that the content of the <titlealt> element contains a title for use in search results for systems that support content search. If not present, this role is fulfilled by the linking role.

subtitle

Specifies that the content of the <titlealt> element contains a subtitle for the document.

hint

Specifies that the content of the <titlealt> element contains a hint about the referenced resource. This is intended for the benefit of map authors; it does not have an effect on processing or output.

-dita-use-conref-target

See for more information.

Alternative titles with the @title-role attribute set to tokens that are not recognized by the processor SHOULD be ignored and not appear in output.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the first paragraph, a space is needed between @title-role and attribute.	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:13:01	
Fixed.					
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 19:56:14	

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <titlealt> element can be used.

Subtitles

The following code sample shows how a map can specify a subtitle for a publication:

```
<map>
  <title>Publication title</title>
  <topicmeta>
    <titlealt title-role="subtitle">Publication subtitle</titlealt>
  </topicmeta>
</map>
```

Multiple alternative titles and their uses

The following code sample shows how a topic reference can specify several alternative titles:

```
<topicref keys="about" href="about.dita">
  <topicmeta>
    <titlealt title-role="linking navigation">About the product</titlealt>
    <titlealt title-role="search">About</titlealt>
    <titlealt title-role="hint">About the Acme TextMax 5000</titlealt>
  </topicmeta>
</topicref>
```

</topicmeta>
</topicref>

1. "About the product" will be used for both linking and navigation titles, for example, when generating related links and rendering a table of contents.
2. "About" will be used for a search title, for example, when providing a title in systems that support dynamic content searches.
3. "About the Acme TextMax 500" provides a hint to map authors as to the contents of the referenced DITA resource. This title is not used in output.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Feels like the fourth paragraph should read "Multiple alternative titles and their roles ."	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:14:59	
Done. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 18:24:52	

Topic: audio (DB00649689)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
This is probably something basic with how domains work, but why don't we include <desc> and <fallback> in this Multimedia elements section? Do we want to include a related link somewhere? maybe in Multimedia elements?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:45:22	
Both the desc and fallback elements are used with more elements than just the multimedia one, so they are grouped with "Body elements" in the spec. We don't use related links to link to other elements that are shown in the examples; it would be unwieldy. Readers of the spec always can use the "DITA elements, A to Z" topic to navigate to a topic. Marking this comment as CLOSED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 11:37:41	

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The <audio> element is modeled on the HTML5 <audio> element.

An audio resource can be referenced by @href, @keyref, and nested <media-source> elements.

Behaviors such as auto-playing, looping, and muting are determined by attributes. When not specified, the default behavior is determined by the user agent that is used to present the media.

Draft comment: Kristen J Eberlein 22 April 2019

If we keep the above wording, we need to define the term *user agent*.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
For a <shortdesc>, how's about "Audio plays an audio (sound) resource."	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:17:11	
Whenever possible, we use the shortdesc to describe what something is (as we did here), then the fallback is to describe what something does .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:00:31	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Usage information

The <audio> element is modeled on the HTML5 <audio> element.

An audio resource can be referenced by @href, @keyref, and nested <media-source> elements.

Behaviors such as auto-playing, looping, and muting are determined by attributes. When not specified, the default behavior is determined by the user agent that is used to present the media.

Draft comment: Kristen J Eberlein 22 April 2019

If we keep the above wording, we need to define the term *user agent*.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Third paragraph: perhaps best to qualify the "behaviors" as "playback behaviors" versus recording, editing, or mixing behaviors.	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:18:47	
Good suggestion; incorporated the wording change.	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:01:31	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Usage information

The <audio> element is modeled on the HTML5 <audio> element.

An audio resource can be referenced by @href, @keyref, and nested <media-source> elements.

Behaviors such as auto-playing, looping, and muting are determined by attributes. When not specified, the default behavior is determined by the user agent that is used to present the media.

Draft comment: Kristen J Eberlein 22 April 2019

If we keep the above wording, we need to define the term *user agent*.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Yes, we need to define "user agent", it's used throughout the rest of the descriptions.	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:54:09	
Have added a definition in a draft comment in the topic. We'll need to decide where in the spec to actually define it.	keberlein	updated	comment	20/11/2021 17:33:08	
Marking this comment as ACCEPTED .					

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

@autoplay

Specifies whether the resource automatically plays when it is presented. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@controls

Specifies whether the presentation of the resource includes user interface controls. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@format

Specifies the MIME type for the resource. This attribute enables processors to avoid loading unsupported resources. If @format is not specified and @keyref is specified, the effective type for the key named by the @keyref attribute is used as the value. If an explicit @format is not specified on either the <audio> element or key definition, processors can use other means, such the URI file extension, to determine the effective MIME type of the resource.

@href

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the audio resource. If @href is specified, specify @format also.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the audio resource.

@loop

Specifies whether the resource loops when played. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@muted

Specifies whether the resource is muted. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@tabindex

Specifies whether the audio resource can be focused and where it participates in sequential keyboard navigation. See @tabindex in the HTML specification (WHATWG version).

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
For @scope . . . how s'bout "Specifies the closeness . . ." for the sake of list item parallelism.	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:20:05	
Good catch. Fixed.					
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:02:50	

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

@autoplay

Specifies whether the resource automatically plays when it is presented. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@controls

Specifies whether the presentation of the resource includes user interface controls. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@format

Specifies the MIME type for the resource. This attribute enables processors to avoid loading unsupported resources. If @format is not specified and @keyref is specified, the effective type for the key named by the @keyref attribute is used as the value. If an explicit @format is not specified on either the <audio> element or key definition, processors can use other means, such the URI file extension, to determine the effective MIME type of the resource.

@href

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the audio resource. If @href is specified, specify @format also.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the audio resource.

@loop

Specifies whether the resource loops when played. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@muted

Specifies whether the resource is muted. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@tabindex

Specifies whether the audio resource can be focused and where it participates in sequential keyboard navigation. See @tabindex in the HTML specification (WHATWG version).

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Double-check all the -dita-use-conref-target, there seems to be an extra space somewhere. In the PDF, it's " -dita-use-conref-target ", here there's a space before the period.	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:43:22	
Hi, Zoe. Formatting in DITAweb is unreliable; that is why we ask people to review the PDF and NOT what is rendered in DITAweb. The extra space shown in DITAweb is a common formatting glitch.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 11:39:56	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

@autoplay

Specifies whether the resource automatically plays when it is presented. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@controls

Specifies whether the presentation of the resource includes user interface controls. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@format

Specifies the MIME type for the resource. This attribute enables processors to avoid loading unsupported resources. If @format is not specified and @keyref is specified, the effective type for the key named by the @keyref attribute is used as the value. If an explicit @format is not specified on either the <audio> element or key definition, processors can use other means, such the URI file extension, to determine the effective MIME type of the resource.

@href

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the audio resource. If @href is specified, specify @format also.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the audio resource.

@loop

Specifies whether the resource loops when played. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@muted

Specifies whether the resource is muted. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@tabindex

Specifies whether the audio resource can be focused and where it participates in sequential keyboard navigation. See @tabindex in the HTML specification (WHATWG version).

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
@format currently states "...such the URI file". Change to "... such as the URI file"					
@loop: do we really want the default to be "true"? I think it should be "false"...	gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 17:44:36	
@muted: why do we default to "true"? Is this what the HTML5 standard does? If not, I think the default should be "false".					
Added the missing word. The default values were approved as part of the proposal process, and yes, they mirror the HTML5 elements and values.	keberlein	updated	comment	15/11/2021 14:40:28	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

@autoplay

Specifies whether the resource automatically plays when it is presented. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@controls

Specifies whether the presentation of the resource includes user interface controls. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@format

Specifies the MIME type for the resource. This attribute enables processors to avoid loading unsupported resources. If @format is not specified and @keyref is specified, the effective type for the key named by the @keyref attribute is used as the value. If an explicit @format is not specified on either the <audio> element or key definition, processors can use other means, such the URI file extension, to determine the effective MIME type of the resource.

@href

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the audio resource. If @href is specified, specify @format also.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the audio resource.

@loop

Specifies whether the resource loops when played. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@muted

Specifies whether the resource is muted. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@tabindex

Specifies whether the audio resource can be focused and where it participates in sequential keyboard navigation. See @tabindex in the HTML specification (WHATWG version).

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
for @scope, if we need to define user agent (and we do) we also need to define 'information unit' unless we define it elsewhere. Is an infomation unit a topic? a map? a submap?	nharrison	updated	comment	16/11/2021 06:54:46	
Nancy, i think that here the scope attribute will work just as it does on a topicref or xref. I think by information unit here, we really are taking about the main map/root publication. Adding a draft comment to the topic so that we remember to improve/clarify the wording.					

Actually, just realized that this topic does not use the new format for attributes. Once this topic uses that format, it will point to the standard definition of @scope -- and list any ways that @scope on audio has any exceptions. Edited the draft comment that I previously added to highlight that.	keberlein	updated	comment	20/11/2021 17:31:42	

Marking the status of this comment to ACCEPTED .					

Topic: media-track (DB00649703)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
User agent needs to be defined.					
Dumb question - what is the expected behavior if you have captions and subtitles? Is that to be handled by the user agent? Should that be noted somewhere?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:53:15	
1. Tracking comments about "user agent" in the audio topic.					
2. Rendering expectations are up to the user agent. We mention that explicitly in the video topic.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 18:34:10	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The media track settings are modeled on the <track> element used in HTML5 media elements. They refer to track resources that use Web Video Text Track Format (WebVTT).

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the <shortdesc>, place a comma between "supplemental" and "text-based".	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:23:30	
Fixed. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:07:02	

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

@format

Specifies the format of the resource being addressed.

@href

Specifies the URI of the track resource.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the track resource.

@kind

Specifies the usage for the track resource. This attribute is modeled on the @kind attribute on the HTML5 <track> element, as described by the *HTML specification, WHATWG version*. The values for this attribute are derived from the HTML5 standard:

captions

Transcription or translation of the dialogue, sound effects, relevant musical cues, and other relevant audio information. This is intended for use when the soundtrack is unavailable, for example, because it is muted or because the user is hard-of-hearing. This information is rendered over the video and labeled as appropriate for hard-of-hearing users.

chapters

Chapter titles, which are intended to be used for navigating the media resource. The chapter titles are rendered as an interactive list in the interface for the user agent.

descriptions

Textual descriptions of the video component of the media resource. This is intended for audio synthesis when the visual component is unavailable, for example, because the user is interacting with the application without a screen or because the user is blind. Descriptions are synthesized as separate audio tracks.

metadata

Tracks intended for use from script. This metadata is not displayed by the user agent.

subtitles

Transcription or translation of the dialogue, suitable for when the sound is available but not understood, for example, because the user does not understand the language of the soundtrack.

Subtitles are rendered over the video.
-dita-use-conref-target
See for more information.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@srclang

Specifies the language of the track resource.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
@scope - parallelism - "Specifies . . ."	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:24:03	
Fixed.					
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:07:31	

Topic: video (DB00649690)

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The <video> element is modeled on the HTML5 <video> element.

A video resource can be referenced by @href, @keyref, and nested <media-source> elements.

Behaviors such as auto-playing, looping, and muting are determined by attributes. When not specified, the default behavior is determined by the user agent that is used to present the media.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the <shortdesc>, how s'bout "Plays a video or audio/visual resource."	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:26:13	
No -- same rationale as for the audio shortdesc.					
Marking this comment as CLOSED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:09:17	

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

Draft comment: rodaande

This list was significantly reworked when the element moved into the base vocabulary; need to validate that the list is still correct for LwDITA.

@autoplay

Specifies whether the resource automatically plays when it is presented. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@controls

Specifies whether the presentation of the resource includes user interface controls. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@format

Specifies the MIME type for the resource. This attribute enables processors to avoid loading unsupported resources. If @format is not specified and @keyref is specified, the effective type for the key named by the @keyref attribute is used as the value. If an explicit @format is not specified on either the <video> element or key definition, processors can use other means, such the URI file extension, to determine the effective MIME type of the resource.

@height

Indicates the vertical dimension for the resulting display. The value of this attribute is a real number (expressed in decimal notation) optionally followed by a unit of measure from the set of cm, em, in, mm, pc, pt, px, and Q (centimeters, ems, inches, picas, points, pixels, millimeters, and quarter-millimeters, respectively). The default unit is px (pixels). Possible values include: "5", "5in", and "10.5cm".

@href

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the video resource. If @href is specified, specify @format also.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the video resource.

@loop

Specifies whether the resource loops when played. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@muted

Specifies whether the resource is muted. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@poster

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the image that is rendered before video playback begins.

@posterkeyref

Specifies a key reference for the poster image.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@tabindex

Draft comment: rodaande

Need to add the linked version of the HTML spec into our resources.

Specifies whether the video resource can be focused and where it participates in sequential keyboard navigation. See @tabindex in the HTML specification (WHATWG version).

@width

Indicates the horizontal dimension for the resulting display. The value of this attribute is a real number (expressed in decimal notation) optionally followed by a unit of measure from the set of cm, em, in, mm, pc, pt, px, and Q (centimeters, ems, inches, picas, points, pixels, millimeters, and quarter-millimeters, respectively). The default unit is px (pixels). Possible values include: "5", "5in", and "10.5cm".

check the -dita-use-conref-target formatting. There seems to be an extra space. zlawson updated comment 14/11/2021 02:55:15

The extra space is a DITAweb formatting glitch.

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021 11:44:28

Marking this comment as **CLOSED**.

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

Draft comment: rodaande

This list was significantly reworked when the element moved into the base vocabulary; need to validate that the list is still correct for LwDITA.

@autoplay

Specifies whether the resource automatically plays when it is presented. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@controls

Specifies whether the presentation of the resource includes user interface controls. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@format

Specifies the MIME type for the resource. This attribute enables processors to avoid loading unsupported resources. If @format is not specified and @keyref is specified, the effective type for the key named by the @keyref attribute is used as the value. If an explicit @format is not specified on either the <video> element or key definition, processors can use other means, such the URI file extension, to determine the effective MIME type of the resource.

@height

Indicates the vertical dimension for the resulting display. The value of this attribute is a real number (expressed in decimal notation) optionally followed by a unit of measure from the set of cm, em, in, mm, pc, pt, px, and Q (centimeters, ems, inches, picas, points, pixels, millimeters, and quarter-millimeters, respectively). The default unit is px (pixels). Possible values include: "5", "5in", and "10.5cm".

@href

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the video resource. If @href is specified, specify @format also.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the video resource.

@loop

Specifies whether the resource loops when played. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@muted

Specifies whether the resource is muted. The following values are recognized: true, false, and -dita-use-conref-target . The default value is true.

@poster

Specifies the absolute or relative URI of the image that is rendered before video playback begins.

@posterkeyref

Specifies a key reference for the poster image.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

@tabindex

Draft comment: rodaande

Need to add the linked version of the HTML spec into our resources.
 Specifies whether the video resource can be focused and where it participates in sequential keyboard navigation. See @tabindex in the HTML specification (WHATWG version).

@width

Indicates the horizontal dimension for the resulting display. The value of this attribute is a real number (expressed in decimal notation) optionally followed by a unit of measure from the set of cm, em, in, mm, pc, pt, px, and Q (centimeters, ems, inches, picas, points, pixels, millimeters, and quarter-millimeters, respectively). The default unit is px (pixels). Possible values include: "5", "5in", and "10.5cm".

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Under @height, the list of units of measure isn't in sync with its abbreviations; 'mm' comes after 'in', but 'millimeters' comes after 'pixels'; not a big thing, just a bit weird when the text says 'respectively.'	nharrison	updated	comment	16/11/2021 07:08:19	
Under @scope, same comment as in <audio> about the term 'information unit'					
Fixed the height attribute -- and ensured that the content about values for @heigh and @width is consistent on all topics that use it: image, video, hazardsymbol, object ...					
The issue about "information unit" will be not applicable when these topics use the standard definitions for @scope; that's on our work list.	keberlein	updated	comment	17/11/2021 11:51:42	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

A <video> element that uses indirect addressing

In the following code sample, the video resource is addressed using a key reference:

```
<video keyref="video"/>
```

Both the URI and the MIME type are specified on the key definition:

```
<keydef keys="video" href="video.mp4" format="video/mp4"/>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Global comment: When crafting examples where there's a	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 03:03:06	

snippet showing an element from a topic and then a snippet showing the <keydef>, do we need to be explicit that one is in a <topic> and one is in a <map>?

I know, because I've played with keys. But someone coming in to do one thing may not be as aware?

For the complex example, I think I'd like to see the keys, not just the description in the comments.

1. I don't think we need to explicitly call out what is in a topic and what is in a DITA map. We certainly do that in the topics that cover keys, key definition, and referencing. I don't think we can provide a full explanation in each element example that uses keys

2. I'm not sure what you mean by "seeing the keys"; the example clearly provides markup for both using a keyref for a video element -- and also the corresponding key definition.

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021 16:17:12

Marking this comment as **CLOSED**.

Topic: shortdesc (DA00508871)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
The short description could be improved so that it states what a short desc, rather than what it does. Maybe the following: "A short description is a sentence or group of sentences that describes the purpose or main point of the topic."	keberlein	updated	comment	11/11/2021 15:35:13	
Incorporated change. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 19:51:25	
Do we want to include a snippet about how it's often used with previews as well, both in rendering and sometimes CMS? To me that's one of the major selling points of why shortdesc is an amazing and awesome feature. If it's just 'the first paragraph', you don't use it at first, and then have major regrets.	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:06:33	
Excellent point, Zoe. Changed the "Usage information"	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:18:56	

to read "When present in topics, the short description is the first paragraph of the topic. It can also be used for hover text, link previews, search results, and more."

Marked as **COMPLETED**.

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

When present in topics, the short description is the first paragraph of the topic. It can also be used for link previews and search results.

When present in maps, the <shortdesc> element is associated with <topicref> elements. This enables map authors to accomplish the following goals:

- Associate a short description with a non-DITA object
- Provide a short description that is specific to the map context and used for link previews

When a <shortdesc> element applies to an entire DITA map, it serves as description only.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
What does the last sentence mean? What is "description only" mean? That it enables you to provide information about the map that doesn't render anywhere?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:12:37	
Should we mention that a topic can only have one shortdesc, but an abstract can have multiple, useful for conditional processing? Or am I conflating "best practices" vs "spec"? 1. Changed to read "it serves only as a description." Yes, the shortdesc at the map level is not rendered anywhere. It might be displayed in a CMS, or it might just be a place that a DITA architect could store info about the purpose of the map. 2. No, we don't need to have info about only one shortdesc if used directly in a topic. That's user guide/learning to author in DITA type of information.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:24:15	

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Usage information

When present in topics, the short description is the first paragraph of the topic. It can also be used for link previews and search results.

When present in maps, the <shortdesc> element is associated with <topicref> elements. This enables map authors to accomplish the following goals:

- Associate a short description with a non-DITA object
- Provide a short description that is specific to the map context and used for link previews

When a <shortdesc> element applies to an entire DITA map, it serves as description only.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Usage information When present in topics, the short description is the first paragraph of the topic. It can also be used for link previews and search results. When present in maps, the element is associated with elements. This enables map authors to accomplish the following goals: Associate a short description with a non-DITA object Provide a short description that is specific to the map context and used for link previews When a element applies to an entire DITA map, it serves as a description only.	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 14:10:26	
Changed to read "it serves only as a description."	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:25:45	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <shortdesc> element can be used.

Short description in a topic

The following code sample shows how a <shortdesc> element can be used in a topic:

```
<topic id="concept">
  <title>Introduction to bird calling</title>
  <shortdesc>If you want to attract more birds to your Acme Bird Feeder, learn the art of bird calling. Bird calling is an efficient way to alert more birds to the presence of your bird feeder.</shortdesc>
  <body>
    <p>Bird calling requires learning:</p>
    <ul>
      <li>Popular and classical bird songs</li>
      <li>How to whistle like a bird</li>
    </ul>
  </body>
</topic>
```

Short description in a map

The following code sample shows how a short description can be used in a DITA map to provide information about a non-DITA resource. The content of the <shortdesc> element is used when a link preview to the Web site for the American Birding Association is generated.

```

<map>
  <title>Enjoying birds</title>
  <!-- ... -->
  <topicref href="birds-in-colorado.dita"/>
  <topicref href="bird-calling.dita"/>
  <topicref href="https://www.birding.example.com/" format="external" type="html">
  <topicmeta>
  <shortdesc>The American Birding Association is only organization
  in North America that specifically caters to recreational birders.
  Its mission is to "inspire all people to enjoy and protect wild birds."
  </topicmeta>
  </topicref>
  <!-- ... -->
</map>

```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the first example, change the id attribute on the topic element from "concept" to something like "bird_calling_intro". I don't think we should have "concept" as an attribute value on a generic topic...	gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 14:18:52	
In the second example, the text " The American Birding Association is only organization" is missing the word "the", and should be changed to: The American Birding Association is the only organization...					
Made both corrections; good catches.					
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:31:39	

Topic: titlehint (DC00810980)

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The <linktitle> element is a convenience element. It is equivalent to a <titlealt> element with @title-role set to hint.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
<linktitle> should be <titlehint>, methinks :-)	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 03:21:55	
Excellent catch, Zoe; thank you!	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 11:54:13	

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <titlehint> element can be used.

Referencing remote DITA resources

The following code sample shows how a <titlehint> element is used to show the title of a referenced topic to map authors. This might be especially helpful in the context of a CCMS with opaque URIs.

```
<topicref href="x-id://AOE82KJAW1B0">  
  <topicmeta>  
    <titlehint>Getting started</titlehint>  
  </topicmeta>  
</topicref>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Example s This section contains examples of how the element can be used. Referencing remote DITA resourcesThe following code sample shows how a element is used to show the title of a referenced topic to map authors. This might be especially helpful in the context of a CCMS with opaque URIs. Getting started	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 18:40:52	
Done. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 19:21:39	

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <titlehint> element can be used.

Referencing remote DITA resources

The following code sample shows how a <titlehint> element is used to show the title of a referenced topic to map authors. This might be especially helpful in the context of a CCMS with opaque URIs.

```
<topicref href="x-id://AOE82KJAW1B0">  
  <topicmeta>  
    <titlehint>Getting started</titlehint>  
  </topicmeta>  
</topicref>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
------------	----------	--------	------	------	---------------

There is only one example, so the title needs to say so.
Remove the figure, since that's what we do when there is only one example.

gjoseph updated comment 14/11/2021 18:41:44

Done

keberlein updated comment 28/11/2021 15:47:15

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Topic: linktitle (DC00811034)

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

Features of DITA maps, such as relationship tables and hierarchy created by nesting <topicref> elements, generate the following kinds of links:

- Links from a topic to its child topics in the map hierarchy
- Links from a topic to its parent topic in the map hierarchy
- Links between sibling topics when the @collection-type attribute of the parent <topicref> element is set to sequence or family

Processors also might use a link title for custom linking scenarios.

The <linktitle> element is a convenience element. It is equivalent to a <titlealt> element with @title-role set to linking.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Do we want to define convenience element somewhere?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 03:26:33	
We do define convenience element; it's just not part of this targeted review. Basically, convenience elements are elements with one or more attributes preset. For example, you can use mapref instead of topicref with format="ditamap". Or you can use linktitle instead of titleat title-role="linking". So, elements for authoring convenience!	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 11:53:02	

But we need to ensure that convenience element is defined explicitly as terminology -- which I don't think it is.					
Setting this comment to ACCEPTED .					

Usage information

Features of DITA maps, such as relationship tables and hierarchy created by nesting <topicref> elements, generate the following kinds of links:

- Links from a topic to its child topics in the map hierarchy
- Links from a topic to its parent topic in the map hierarchy
- Links between sibling topics when the @collection-type attribute of the parent <topicref> element is set to sequence or family

Processors also might use a link title for custom linking scenarios.

The <linktitle> element is a convenience element. It is equivalent to a <titlealt> element with @title-role set to linking.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
1st para: "such as relationship tables and hierarchies..."	fwegmann	updated	comment	21/11/2021 20:51:11	
Done. Good catch!	keberlein	updated	comment	26/11/2021 10:21:26	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and @title-role .

For this element, @title-role has a default value of linking.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Why would I ever change @title-role?					
Is that attribute here because it's a specialization of <titlealt>? Can/should we recommend not changing it?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 03:17:37	
Yes, the title-role attribute is present on the linktitle element because linktitle is specialized from titlealt. I would not expect users to change the value for the title-role attribute on linktitle, but some implementation might come up with something crazy. We avoid making "best practices" suggestions in the spec because ... it's a spec and not a user guide.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 11:50:03	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Topic: media-source (DB00649699)

Paragraph-level comments

Rendering expectations

When multiple <media-source> elements are present, the user agent evaluates them in document order and selects the first resource that can be played.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
There's "user agent" that I think we need to define somewhere.	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:50:30	
Closing this comment, since we are tracking this issue in the audio topic.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 11:42:03	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Attributes

The following attributes are available on this element: universal attributes and the attributes defined below.

@format

Specifies the format of the resource being addressed.

@href

Specifies the URI of the media resource.

@keyref

Specifies a key reference to the media resource.

@scope

The @scope attribute describes the closeness of the relationship between the current document and the target resource. Resources in the same information unit are considered "local"; resources in the same system as the referencing content but not part of the same information unit are considered "peer"; and resources outside the system, such as Web pages, are considered "external".

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
@scope . . . parallelism . . . "Specifies . . . "	sdoherty	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:22:03	
Good catch; fixed.	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 20:06:05	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Topic: navtitle (DA00508884)

Paragraph-level comments

Processing expectations

Processing expectations are dictated by the rules for the <titlealt> element.

In some cases, when processing a <topicref> element that has no @href attribute, the navigation title also can be used as the title of the generated pseudo-topic, if applicable.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
I wonder if readers will understand what we mean by "pseudo-topic". That being said, so far I have failed to come up with better language :(gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 18:24:34	
Believe me, both Robert and I have struggled with this one.					

Changed to simply "generated topic" -- Thank you, Chris Nitchie!	keberlein	updated	comment	15/11/2021 14:42:45	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <navtitle> element can be used.

<navtitle> in a topic

The following code sample shows a <navtitle> element used in a topic. The <navtitle> element contains a shorter title that processors render in a TOC or navigation pane when the topic is published.

```
<task id="publishing-dita">
  <title>Publishing a DITA information set in PDF</title>
  <shortdesc>You can quickly publish your DITA information to PDF.
</shortdesc>
  <prolog>
  <navtitle>Publishing in PDF</navtitle>
  </prolog>
  <!-- ... -->
</task>
```

<navtitle> in a map

The following code sample shows a <navtitle> element used in a DITA map. The navigation title in the map takes precedence over a navigation title that is specified in the topic.


```

<map xml:lang="en">
  <title>Publishing a DITA information set</title>
  <topicref href="GUID-gibberish.dita">
    <topicmeta>
      <navtitle>Publishing to PDF</navtitle>
    </topicmeta>
  </topicref>
</map>

```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the last example, can we find a better @href value than "GUID-gibberish.dita" please?	gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 18:28:19	
Changed to href="2378d670f2op78.dita"	keberlein	updated	comment	15/11/2021 14:44:26	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Examples

This section contains examples of how the <navtitle> element can be used.

<navtitle> in a topic

The following code sample shows a <navtitle> element used in a topic. The <navtitle> element contains a shorter title that processors render in a TOC or navigation pane when the topic is published.

```

<task id="publishing-dita">
  <title>Publishing a DITA information set in PDF</title>
  <shortdesc>You can quickly publish your DITA information to PDF.
</shortdesc>
  <prolog>
    <navtitle>Publishing in PDF</navtitle>
  </prolog>
  <!-- ... -->
</task>

```

<navtitle> in a map

The following code sample shows a <navtitle> element used in a DITA map. The navigation title in the map takes precedence over a navigation title that is specified in the topic.

```

<map xml:lang="en">
  <title>Publishing a DITA information set</title>
  <topicref href="GUID-gibberish.dita">
    <topicmeta>
      <navtitle>Publishing to PDF</navtitle>
    </topicmeta>
  </topicref>
</map>

```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
What is the standard practice for short element contents as with <shortdesc> in this example? I would set the end tag directly after the last character of the text node.	fwegmann	updated	comment	21/11/2021 21:00:29	
For the code samples that we have in the example sections? We try to indent four spaces. Sometimes what we do depends on the how wrapping occurs in the output. Here, I made the correction that you suggested.	keberlein	updated	comment	26/11/2021 10:28:27	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Topic: Basic topic elements (DA00509438)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Is the topic actually here twice, or is that an artifact of how the review was set up?					
Really dumb thought. In the spec, these are in an "Element reference" section. At the beginning of that section is some information about A-Z.					
Do we want to mention that in this reference section, elements are listed in alphabetical order? Do we want to link to where the proper order of elements is described? Or that we're relying on XML processors to enforce that?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 01:07:43	
I'm sure this was explained at some point in time, but my brain did not follow or retain it. What happened to the contains/is contained by sections? when I'm learning something, I often find that information super useful. (I use it all the time with xslt-fo reference stuff because I can never remember what can go where.)					
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mistake 2. I don't think we need to mention that elements are listed in alphabetical order; that's standard for a reference guide. 3. We don't describe the order of the elements in the spec; that is mandated by the grammar files. 4. The "Contains/Contains by" content was moved into a non-normative appendix in DITA 1.3, thankfully, I 	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:37:13	

say thankfully because we made corrections in both errata editions! We could not have done that if the information had been in the actual topics; those would have been substantive changes that would have required the full spec approval process.

5. For DITA 2.0, we are not including the "Contains/Contains by" info in the spec. IF we can develop a way to accurately generate the info, we might release it in an adjunct publication.

Marking this comment as **CLOSED**.

I'm with Zoe in missing the contains/contained by sections; can each lang ref topic have a link to a table with that info?

nharrison updated comment 16/11/2021 06:14:27

No. The spec cannot contain that information. Many reasons:

- We have NO reliable way to generate it.
- We removed it from DITA 1.3!

keberlein updated comment 16/11/2021 06:27:22

If possible, we'll publish an adjunct publication for DITA 2.0.

Marking this comment as **CLOSED**.

Paragraph-level comments

The generic topic structure is used for untyped topics.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Your call -- is it worth mentioning that "topic" is popular for converted content that contains multiple info types and has yet to be refactored?	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 20:45:14	
I think ditabase would be more useful for that!	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:43:48	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

The generic topic structure is used for untyped topics.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
I don't think "typed topic" or "untyped topic" is ever defined in the spec.	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 00:44:31	

If I'm coming into this (especially without reading the 3.3 DITA Topics section), I have no idea what a 'typed' or 'untyped' topic is.

maybe: The generic topic structure is used for untyped, that is, unspecialized, units of content.

Changed to read "The basic topic elements provide the structural framework for a topic: title, short description, prolog, body, and related links."

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021 16:38:56

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Topic: subtitle (DC00811005)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
shortdesc: A subtitle is a subordinate title...	fwegmann	updated	comment	21/11/2021 21:14:58	
I think we need to keep it as "A subtitle is a subordinate title for a resource ." (Emphasis added) The "for a resource" phrase is necessary to explain the second sentence in the shortdesc.	keberlein	updated	comment	26/11/2021 10:31:00	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Paragraph-level comments

Subtitle used within a map

The following code sample shows how a map can specify a subtitle for the publication:

```
<map>
  <title>Map title</title>
  <topicmeta>
    <subtitle>Sub title</subtitle>
  </topicmeta>
</map>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Can we find better values of title and subtitle within a map? I don't find these to be useful as examples. We could even	nharrison	updated	comment	16/11/2021 07:27:41	

reuse the ones in the second [topic] example, since those are more illustrative of the concept.

Changed to the following:

<map>

<title>Frankenstein</title>

<topicmeta>

<subtitle>The Modern Prometheus</subtitle>

</topicmeta>

</map>

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

keberlein updated comment 17/11/2021
19:40:40

Topic: bodydiv (DA00508956)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the shortdesc - addition should be additional, I think. Maybe instead of "It is useful" use "This element is useful"?					
Do we want to link to <section>? <div>?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 01:25:28	
Do we want the @id for the <bodydiv> in the example to be "div"? In my brain, div might imply the <div> element or something. Maybe "reuseMe"?					
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Yes; have changed "addition" to "additional".2. No need to link to div topic3. Changed the value of the id attr in the example; thanks for noting this.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:47:23	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The <bodydiv> element cannot contain a title. If a title is required, use nested topics.

The <bodydiv> element is often used to group a sequence of related elements for reuse, so that another topic can reference the entire set with a single @conref or @conkeyref attribute.

The <bodydiv> element can nest itself, which makes it a good specialization base for general topic content. Because the <bodydiv> element allows <section>, it cannot be used within <section> elements. Use the <div> element to group content that might occur in both topic bodies and sections.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
In the <shortdesc> for this topic, I recommned some alternat phrasing for the sake of parallelism: "It is useful primarily as a base for specialization and for reuse. Hmmm ... I think your suggested wording is a little off, since we don't want to call the bodydiv element a "base for reuse". Changed the shortdesc to read "A body division is a grouping of sequential elements within the body of a topic. There is no <i>additional</i> semantic meaning. It is useful primarily for reuse and as a specialization base." The italics mark where I corrected a typo. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:00:30	
	keberlein	updated	comment	12/11/2021 19:48:24	

Usage information

The <bodydiv> element cannot contain a title. If a title is required, use nested topics.

The <bodydiv> element is often used to group a sequence of related elements for reuse, so that another topic can reference the entire set with a single @conref or @conkeyref attribute.

The <bodydiv> element can nest itself, which makes it a good specialization base for general topic content. Because the <bodydiv> element allows <section>, it cannot be used within <section> elements. Use the <div> element to group content that might occur in both topic bodies and sections.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
First paragraph: s/There is no addition /There is no additional /	gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 13:40:59	
Fixed. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:47:47	

Topic: dita (DA00508995)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
<p>I'm not sure this example makes sense anymore, now that the task/concept/reference topics are not in this specification, and are broken out into a separate spec, what is a <concept> or a <task> or a <reference>?</p>					
<p>Minimally there should be one <topic> example in here. If we keep the concept/task/reference, there should be some explanation of what they are. This spec, and especially this section is not talking about the specializations.</p>	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 01:37:49	
<p>And, yes, please, more details about what a ditabase document-type is. I have no idea what it is or what it is used for. I searched the spec and couldn't figure it out.</p>					
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Yes, this is tricky. We cannot use an example just using base elements, since the base edition ONLY includes topic.2. Changed the intro to the example to read "The following code sample shows a ditabase document that contains multiple topics. The concept, reference , and tasks elements are all specializations of topic.3. Added additional information to the "Usage information" section	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 18:17:32	
<p>----</p> <p>Marking this comment as COMPLETED.</p>					

Paragraph-level comments

Usage information

The <dita> element cannot be specialized. It is provided as a container that can manage any sequence of any type of topic. Topic nesting rules can be configured in the document-type shell.

Draft comment: Kristen J Eberlein 01 November 2021

Do we want to mention common use case for the ditabase document-type? For example, serving as a file that contains reusable content for portion of a library or being the (temporary) output for a migration operation. Can folks think of other ways that ditabase is used?

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Ditabase topics can be useful during conversions. When moving Flare or Word "chapters" to DITA, it can be useful to convert the entire chapter to a diatabase topic and THEN start to split it up into appropriately typed DITA topic types. Not pretty, but it is one more thing that teams migrating to DITA can exploit.	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:04:21	
Changed the "Usage information" section to contain the following: The ditabase document type is a container topic that can manage any sequence of any type of topic. It can be used to hold elements designed for reuse; it also is useful as an intermediate output for conversion operations.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 18:13:08	
The dita element cannot be specialized. Topic nesting rules can be configured in the document-type shell.					

Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Topic: related-links (DA00509214)

Paragraph-level comments

Rendering expectations

Related links usually are displayed at the end of the topic, although some Web-based help systems might display them in a separate navigation frame.

Links specified within the <related-links> element typically are displayed together with any links that are generated based on the map context.

PDF or print-oriented output commonly ignores hierarchical links such as those with roles of ancestor, parent, child, descendant, next, previous, or sibling.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Why are we talking about hierarchical links when discussing rendering expectations for related-links? I'm not sure this is the right location for this information. However, I'm not sure where that information is. I was trying to figure out where it's spelled out how parent/child links are 'expected' to be rendered and I didn't have luck finding it (partially because I went cross-eyed looking at the 104 references to "linking".)	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 02:02:38	

Can we please add a related link to the related-links section of the spec?

Can we please have an example to a non-external topic?

1. Why talking about it - I think because they can be defined here, and for existing processors, the information usually ends up here as part of a toolchain; thus, this becomes the primary container element when determining how to render those links.

2. I think this would be good, but I don't think we have a good target today that talks about hierarchical links. I'll add a draft-comment here to add one if/when we have a good target.

3. Agreed re: an example that is not external

randerson updated comment 15/11/2021 21:01:13

Zoe, i feel your pain ... Here's what I have done:

- Ensured that the example includes a reference to an non-external topic. (Robert added it.)
- Having a related link to the "related-links section of the [archSpec] is difficult. Although a "DITA linking" topic exists, it currently just focuses on the @format, @hred, @scope, and @type attribute. I don't think that meets your needs. Robert added a draft comment to the related-links topic; I added one to the "DITA maps and their usage" topic, which is a placeholder for new content to be developed. Zoe, can you look at that topic, please? It's currently number 5.1."

keberlein updated comment 2/12/2021 14:53:24

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Rendering expectations

Related links usually are displayed at the end of the topic, although some Web-based help systems might display them in a separate navigation frame.

Links specified within the <related-links> element typically are displayed together with any links that are generated based on the map context.

PDF or print-oriented output commonly ignores hierarchical links such as those with roles of ancestor, parent, child, descendant, next, previous, or sibling.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
So 'links generated based on the map context' are the	nharrison	updated	comment	16/11/2021 06:30:05	

hierarchical links mentioned in the next paragraph, which are ignored by PDF and print-oriented output.

Perhaps the first sentence could end with 'generated based on the hierarchical map context' to make the distinction clear.

Changed to read "links generated based on the hierarchy of the DITA map."

keberlein updated comment 20/11/2021 17:35:49

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Example

The following code sample show how the <related-link> element is used to specify links to external information that always will be relevant to the topic:

```
<related-links
  scope="external" format="html">
  <link href="http://www.example.org">
  <linktext>Example 1</linktext>
</link>
  <link href="http://www.example.com">
  <linktext>Example 2</linktext>
</link>
</related-links>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
"Always relevant" feels a bit 1990's -- suggesting a more static information architecture. With dynamic assembly of topics, knowing what is or is not relevant is more tricky. Perhaps something like "links to external information that are durable".	sdoherly	updated	comment	11/11/2021 21:08:30	
Changed to "is used to specify stable links to external information:"	keberlein	updated	comment	15/11/2021 15:50:53	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Example

The following code sample show how the <related-link> element is used to specify links to external information that always will be relevant to the topic:

```
<related-links
  scope="external" format="html">
  <link href="http://www.example.org">
  <linktext>Example 1</linktext>
```

```

</link>
<link href="http://www.example.com">
<linktext>Example 2</linktext>
</link>
</related-links>

```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
ExampleThe following code sample show s how the element is used to specify links to external information that always will be relevant to the topic: Example 1 Example 2	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 14:08:27	
Fixed; thanks for catching this. Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:51:20	

Topic: Domain elements (DA00513581)

Paragraph-level comments

General purpose domains are not specific to any type of information, such as the hazard statement domain that provides elements for describing hazardous situations.

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
We need a better shortdesc here. Looks as if this has not been edited since DITA 1.3.	keberlein	updated	comment	11/11/2021 20:07:27	
Changed to "A domain is a grouping of related DITA elements that can be integrated into document-type shells. The base edition of DITA includes a variety of domains for use in topics and maps." Marking this comment as COMPLETED .	keberlein	updated	comment	13/11/2021 14:53:39	
Possibly add "as a group"? "A domain is a grouping of related DITA elements that can be easily integrated into document-type shells as a group." It might be redundant with the 'grouping' but I'm still fuzzy on domains and wearing my "I'm just learning" hat...	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 03:09:02	
No -- we don't "integrate domains" into shells "as a	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:53:34	

group". We just integrate them.

Topic: body (DA00509354)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Do we want to point people towards the Body elements section so they know what goes into the "content" of a topic?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 01:18:47	
No -- This is an element reference, not a publication for people to learn DITA. If we added this sort of related links, we'd really have them everywhere. I wish we could make the spec serve all possible readers, but we cannot. We have to assume a basic knowledge of DITA on the part of people coming to the spec.					
In an ideal world, the DITA TC be able to develop a DITA primer, which provide people with the necessary background knowledge. We'd love to be able to do that, but lack the resources.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 16:55:58	
Marking this comment as CLOSED .					

Paragraph-level comments

Example

The following code sample shows a DITA topic that contains a title and a body.

```
<topic id="styleguidebold">
  <title>Mycompany Style Guide: the <xmlelement>b</xmlelement> element</title>

  <body><p>Use the bold tag <b>for visual emphasis only</b>; do not use it if another
  phrase-level element better signifies the reason for the emphasis.</p>
</body>
</topic>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
ExampleThe following code sample shows a DITA topic that contains a title and a body. Mycompany Style Guide: theb element	gjoseph	updated	change	14/11/2021 13:37:38	

Use the bold tag **for visual emphasis only** ; . ~~Ⓜ~~ Do not use it if another phrase-level element better signifies the reason for the emphasis.

Made the suggested change.

keberlein updated comment 14/11/2021
16:59:04

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Topic: topic (DA00508876)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
This is incredibly dumb, but why is the @id attribute required? Is there a processing expectation?					
Do we want to include <prolog> in the example? Shouldn't we include <abstract> instead? If <prolog> is a primary structural component of a topic, why isn't it listed as a "basic topic element"?	zlawson	updated comment		14/11/2021 02:34:29	
If we keep reference to <prolog>, should we add a related link to it?					
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The id attribute is required on topic to facilitate reuse (originally conref).2. Good catch, Zoe; yes, the prolog topic should be moved into "basic topic elements." And yes, it should be in the example.3. No, we don't want a related link to prolog4. I don't want abstract in the example; I think it dilutes the importance of shortdesc	keberlein	updated comment		15/11/2021 15:56:16	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Paragraph-level comments

Example

The following code sample shows the primary structural components of a topic: title, short description, prolog, body, and related links.

```
<topic id="topic">  
  <title>The basic structure of a topic</title>  
  <shortdesc/>  
  <prolog/>
```

```
<body/>
<related-links/>
</topic>
```

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Does this example really add value? I think we should either provide a reasonable example with content or not provide an example. Most XML editor tools will help the user understand the basic structure as shown in this example, making this example seem silly.	gjoseph	updated	comment	14/11/2021 15:14:56	
Changed the example to contain the following. It's rudimentary but an improvement: <topic id="topic"> <title>The basic structure of a topic</title> <shortdesc>A topic has a well-established structure. </shortdesc> <prolog> <!-- Metadata can be stored here.--> </prolog> <body> <p>A typical topic contains a title, short description, and body.</p> </body> <related-links> <!-- Related links can be defined directly in a topic or by using a relationship table.--></related-links> </topic>	keberlein	updated	comment	16/11/2021 05:20:34	
Marking this comment as COMPLETED .					

Topic: Alternative-titles domain elements (DC00810954)

Topic-level comments

Annotation	Reviewer	Status	Type	Date	Topic version
Do we need any reference to the <titlealt> element here?	zlawson	updated	comment	14/11/2021 03:14:50	
I don't think so. We don't link to the specialization base from any of the other domain topics.	keberlein	updated	comment	14/11/2021 17:48:37	
But maybe? This is a new domain, and titlealt is a new element ... ----- I finally got the chance to talk to Robert about this. I added the following sentence to the short description:					

"The elements in the alternative-titles domain are specialized from the titlealt element."

Marking this comment as **COMPLETED**.

Paragraph-level comments