

[OBIX-186] Broken Fragment (2) Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"The link checker at: <http://validator.w3.org/checklink>, reports two (2) broken fragments in the current draft.

Not really broken fragments but errors from using a base URL with fragments that don't resolve to that base URL.

In the current draft, the errors occur next to each other:

<p class=""MsoNormal"">Existing standards SHOULD be used when applicable for OBIX WebSocket implementations including:</p>

<ul style=""margin-top:0in"" type=""disc"">

<li class=""MsoNormal"">RFC 4346!/2246

"

Comments

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [10/Apr/14]

Removed the references because of [OBIX-117](#) and [OBIX-184](#), thus also removed the links

Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]

Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-185] Redirects (7) Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"The link checker at: <http://validator.w3.org/checklink>, reports seven (7) redirects in the current draft.

Lines: 736, 804 <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/> redirected to <https://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/>
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

Line: 743 <http://www.unc.edu/> redirected to <http://unc.edu/>
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

Line: 898 <http://www.oasis-open.org/> redirected to <https://www.oasis-open.org/>
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

Line: 903 <http://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/trademark> redirected to <https://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/trademark>
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

Line: 801 http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/comments/index.php?wg_abbrev=obix redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/committees/comments/index.php?wg_abbrev=obix
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

Line: 810 <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/ipr.php> redirected to <https://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/ipr.php>
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

Line: 842 <http://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/ipr> redirected to <https://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/ipr>
Status: 301 -> 200 OK"

Comments

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [26/Feb/14]

Will update links

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [10/Apr/14]

Changed URLs, not sure though if these edits preserve during creation of a new public draft version

Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]

Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-184] 2.3 Security - Missing Normative References (2), superseded normative references Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"2.3 Security reads in part:

Existing standards SHOULD be used when applicable for OBIX WebSocket implementations including:

RFC 4346/2246 - The TLS Protocol (Transport Layer Security)

RFCs 4346 and 2246 are not referenced under 1.2 Normative References (reasoning that the SHOULD requirement statement makes these references normative for conformance).

However, RFC 4346 supersedes RFC 2246 and RFC 4346 has been superseded by RFC 5246."

Comments

- Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [26/Feb/14]
- Connected to issue [OBIX-117](#)
- Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [10/Apr/14]
- Added reference to the newest TLS standard to the non-normative references section, this also resolves [OBIX-117](#)
- Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]
- Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-121] 1.2 Normative References RFC3986 Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"1.2 Normative References reads in part:

Berners-Lee, T., Fielding, R., Masinter, L., ""Uniform Resource Identifier (URI): Generic Syntax"", IETF RFC 3986, January 2005.
<http://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc3986.txt>.

The correct citation reads:

Berners-Lee, T., Fielding, R., and L. Masinter, ""Uniform Resource Identifier (URI): Generic Syntax"", STD 66, RFC 3986, January 2005.
<http://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc3986.txt>

*****"

Comments

Comment by Matthias Hub [10/Apr/14]
Changed as suggested - also remove the trailing "." for the other references when applicable
Comment by Toby Considine [30/Jun/15]
Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-120] 1.2 Normative References RFC6455 Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Trivial
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"1.2 Normative References currently reads: ***** [RFC6455] Fette, I Melnikov, A, ""The WebSocket Protocol"", IETF RFC 6455, December 2011. http://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc6455.txt . ***** There should be a comma after the ""I"" following Fette. "
--

Comments

Comment by Matthias Hub [10/Apr/14]
Added comma as suggested
Comment by Toby Considine [30/Jun/15]
Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-119] 1.3 Non-Normative References - empty Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 09/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
--------------	-----	------------------	-------

Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

1.3 Non-Normative References is empty and should be deleted.

Comments

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [09/Apr/14]

Deleted as suggested

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [10/Apr/14]

As mentioned in [OBIX 117](#) and [OBIX 184](#) added a non-normative reference (as this reference was mentioned within a SHOULD section)

Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]

Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-118] 2.2 Requests - vague references Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"2.2 Requests reads in part:

For more details regarding the request flow see the sections below.

The reference to ""sections below"" leaves the reader to puzzle out for themselves which sections may have been meant. Normative sections? Non-normative examples, etc."

Comments

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [10/Apr/14]

Changed it as suggested to a specific section (2.2.4) and worded it specifically that is an example, now it reads: "For a detailed example of the request flow see section 2.2.4 below."

Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]

Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-117] Missing References - RFC 4346/2246 Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 10/Apr/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"2.3 Security reads in part:

Existing standards SHOULD be used when applicable for OBIX WebSocket implementations including:

RFC 4346/2246 - The TLS Protocol (Transport Layer Security)

RFC2246 has been superseded by RFC4346.

RFC4346 has been superseded by RFC5246

Dierks, T. and E. Rescorla, ""The Transport Layer Security (TLS) Protocol Version 1.2"", RFC 5246, August 2008. <http://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc5246.txt>

It is incorrect to recommend (SHOULD) use of superseded standards. An implementation MAY honor a protocol that was defined by a superseded standard but superseded standards don't have the same standing as current standards."

Comments

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [10/Apr/14]

Added reference to the newest TLS standard to the non-normative references section, see also [OBIX-184](#)

Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]

Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-107] Hanging paragraphs (4 cases) Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 05/Jun/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		

Labels:	None
Environment:	TAB Review

Description

"There are several hanging paragraphs, that is where a header occurs followed immediately by content. Which means if I cite ""2 WebSocket Binding"", do I mean all of chapter 2 or do I just mean the text that immediately follows that heading?

There are four (4) hanging paragraphs in this draft."

Comments

Comment by Toby Considine [28/May/14]
It looks like this issue is fully addressed in WD11.
Comment by Matthias Hub [05/Jun/14]
Minor changes in the heading paragraphs
Comment by Toby Considine [30/Jun/15]
Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-103] Examples as normative? Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 26/May/14

Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS PR01
Fix Version/s:	WS WD11

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"1 introduction reads : ""All text is normative unless otherwise labeled.""

Section 2.2.4 Example Request Flow bears no label to distinguish itself from any other section, including 3. Conformance.

The other drafts will be noted separately but a uniform statement concerning normative text in each draft would be one approach to solving this problem.

Suggestion: Proof to make sure the normative prose specifies what is said in the example."

Comments

Comment by Matthias Hub [26/May/14]
Added a short text preceding the example to denote it as non-normative
Comment by Toby Considine [30/Jun/15]
Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-86] Table formatting and captioning issues Created: 15/Dec/13 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 16/Jan/14	
Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS WD09
Fix Version/s:	WS WD10

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Chris Bogen	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Won't Fix		
Labels:	None		

Resolution:	Table captions were updated. Discussions on the mailing list showed that regarding the table at the end either it should be left like it is in WD09 or only horizontal lines should be shown. It was decided to leave it for the first public review like in WD09.
--------------------	---

Description

The table captions should be consistent with other TC documents. Refer to the core specification WD for examples. Also, the format of tables near the end of the document is awkward. Since the cell borders are not aligned, it may be better to not use those borders at all.

Comments

Comment by Matthias Hub [16/Dec/13]
I reviewed the table captions, thanks for the hint! Regarding the table at the end of the document I'll send a mail to the mailing list.
Comment by Matthias Hub [17/Dec/13]
Updated in WD10, please review
Comment by Toby Considine [30/Jun/15]
Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04

[OBIX-85] Various editorial issues Created: 15/Dec/13 Updated: 30/Jun/15 Resolved: 16/Jan/14	
Status:	Closed
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	WebSocket
Affects Version/s:	WS WD09
Fix Version/s:	WS WD10

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Chris Bogen	Assignee:	Matthias Hub
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		

Proposal:	Fix grammatical and style issues.
Resolution:	Incorporated suggestions

Description

There are various grammatical and stylistic issues that should be addressed before public review.

Line 137: "together the" needs a comma or a "then"

Line 139: a comma is needed after "context"

Line 158: "MUST not be empty" is redundant if you are saying that it must contain other objects

Line 167: Gramatically incorrect - "exchange pattern the REST-style"

Line 168: Missing comma after "For that"

Line 169: Missing comma after "After a successful connection to the OBIX server"

Line 170: "make operation"...make is a proper term and should be distinguished as such with bold or italicized font

Line 171: "behaves the same than"...the "than" is inappropriate

Line 201: The term "contract" should be capitalized

Line 230: missing a comma after "is open"

Line 231: " a property of the watched objects is changed"...should be ...that is changed

Line 271: "must" should be in all caps

Comments

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [16/Dec/13]

Thanks for the thorough review!

Line 137: "together the" needs a comma or a "then"

> done

Line 139: a comma is needed after "context"

> done

Line 158: "MUST not be empty" is redundant if you are saying that it must contain other objects

> done

Line 167: Gramatically incorrect - "exchange pattern the REST-style"

> I changed that to: "As WebSocket follows a message exchange pattern the REST-style messages of OBIX needs to be wrapped."

Line 168: Missing comma after "For that"

> done

Line 169: Missing comma after "After a successful connection to the OBIX server"

> done

Line 170: "make operation"...make is a proper term and should be distinguished as such with bold or italicized font

Line 171: "behaves the same than"...the "than" is inappropriate

Line 201: The term "contract" should be capitalized

Line 230: missing a comma after "is open"

Line 231: " a property of the watched objects is changed"...should be ...that is changed

> removed as it is now in core spec

Line 271: "must" should be in all caps

> done

Comment by [Matthias Hub](#) [17/Dec/13]

Updated in WD10, please review

Comment by [Toby Considine](#) [30/Jun/15]

Closed with WD44 prior to reporting for CSD04