



Advancing E-Business Standards Since 1993

FINAL

SCA-Policy TC Teleconference

12 January 2009

Chairs

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
fred carter	AmberPoint	Group Member
Dale Moberg	Axway Software*	Group Member
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
Michael Beisiegel	IBM	Group Member
David Booz	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Simon Holdsworth	IBM	Group Member
Meeraj Kunnumpurath	Individual	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ashok Malhotra	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Sanjay Patil	SAP AG*	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Tai-Hsing Cha	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Murty Gurajada	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Fabian Ritzmann	Sun Microsystems	Group Member

Contents

Resolutions.....	2
Actions	2
Agenda	2
(Item 3) Agenda Bashing	4
(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC	4
(Item 5) TC Logistics.....	4
(Item 6) Action Items.....	4
(Item 7) New Issues	5
(Item 8) Existing Issues	5
Conformance.....	5
ISSUE-48: Transaction defaults are not optimal	5
ISSUE-62: RFC2119 text updates	6
ISSUE-32: Security intent which allows a client to authenticate a server.....	6
Issue Status Reporting - for Liaison Committee.....	7
AOB	7

Resolutions

Resolution: Meeting minutes of TC F2F meeting of 5th January 2008 accepted.

Resolution: Issue 48 is resolved with the text changes in the document linked from <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200812/msg00018.html>

Resolution: Issue 32 is resolved with the proposal contained in <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00007.html> with the addition of a new profile intent called "authentication" which references the clientAuthentication intent

Actions

ACTION 20090112-01: (MIke E) Raise an Issue regarding lack of formal XML definition of Intents defined in the Policy spec.

ACTION 20090112-02: (Dave B) To formally respond to liaison committee with the text held in the email referenced above.

Action 20090112-03: (Ashok) Raise an issue regarding the places where interaction intents can be attached

Agenda

1. Roll call

2. Confirm minute taker, Mike Edwards

3. Agenda bashing

4. Meeting Minutes

Vote to accept minutes from Jan 5, 2009 meeting

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00002.html>

5. TC Logistics:

a. Recording issue status - 5 Open

b. F2F proposal - Jan 28,29 at Oracle in Redwood Shores

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200812/msg00000.html>

6. ACTION ITEMS

a. 20081124-01: Rich L & Ashok - Build the detailed proposal for the resolution of Issue 57

b. 20081215-01: (Ashok & Rich) To write up a detailed proposal for Issue 32

c. 20090105-01: Dave B to write up spec text for Issue 33 based on latest proposal

7. New Issues

None

8. Issue Discussion

a. Conformance

Email from Liason:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00008.html>

Proposed Response:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00010.html>

a. ISSUE-48: Transaction defaults are not optimal

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-48>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200812/msg00018.html>

b. ISSUE-62: RFC2119 text updates

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-62>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00000.html>

Latest Email:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00009.html>

c. ISSUE-33: Capabilities

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-33>

Proposal:

d. ISSUE-32: Security intent which allows a client to authenticate a server

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-32>

Latest email:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00007.html>

e. ISSUE 57: Fine grain authorization intent

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-57>

Proposal:

9. AOB

a. straggler roll

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

No changes

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Vote to accept minutes from Jan 5th, 2008 meeting

**Resolution: Meeting minutes of TC F2F meeting of 5th
January 2008 accepted.**

(Item 5) TC Logistics

There are 5 Open Issues

a) F2F Meeting - 28/29 January

Requesting that all people who intend to attend the F2F should let Ashok know

(Item 6) Action Items

20081124-01: Rich L & Ashok - Build the detailed proposal for the resolution of Issue 57
Outstanding

20081215-01: (Ashok & Rich) To write up a detailed proposal for Issue 32

DONE

20090105-01: Dave B to write up spec text for Issue 33 based on latest proposal

Outstanding

(Item 7) New Issues

None

(Item 8) Existing Issues

Conformance

Email from Liason:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00008.html>

Proposed Response:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00010.html>

Ashok: So you're saying that the language specs depend on the Policy spec, but Policy does not depend on the language specs?

Dave: Right

Mike E: Dont the contents of Section 10 depend on the Bindings specs?

Dave B: No, the formal definition of those intents is here in the Policy spec

Mike E: There is a problem in that there is no formal XML definition of those Intents in the Policy spec

ACTION 20090112-01: (Mike E) Raise an Issue regarding lack of formal XML definition of Intents defined in the Policy spec.

ACTION 20090112-02: (Dave B) To formally respond to liaison committee with the text held in the email referenced above.

ISSUE-48: Transaction defaults are not optimal

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-48>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200812/msg00018.html>

Start in section 10.3 of the file sca-policy-1[1].1-spec-CD01-Rev11+issue48.doc linked from the email above.

Then 10.6.1

New section: 10.6.3

+ formal XML definition at the end of section 10.8

Ashok: So the argument for this approach is that it will be a very common pattern and so it is best to make it simple?

Dave: Yes

Dave moves to accept the text changes in the linked document as the resolution of Issue 48

Seconded by Martin Chapman

Accepted unanimously.

Resolution: **Issue 48 is resolved with the text changes in the document linked from <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200812/msg00018.html>**

ISSUE-62: RFC2119 text updates

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-62>

Proposal:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00000.html>

Dave & Mike replied here:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00009.html>

<Discussion of the treatment of "may" in the original text>

Ashok: I note that Issue 44 introduced formal definitions for interaction and implementation intents. But the spec does not say that interaction intents cannot be applied to implementations

Action 20090112-03: (Ashok) Raise an issue regarding the places where interaction intents can be attached

Mike Edwards will work to prepare the next draft of the proposal for this Issue
- Aim to complete in time for next week's meeting

Ashok: Spec has many layers of changes on it - can these be accepted?

ISSUE-32: Security intent which allows a client to authenticate a server

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-32>

Latest email:

<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00007.html>

- Changes for issue 32.doc attached to this email

Ashok: replace current "authentication" intent with:

- serverAuthentication
- clientAuthentication
- mutualAuthentication

last one is a profile intent combining the 1st two

Dave: The qualifiers continue? (transport & message)

Ashok: Yes - for all 3

Mike E: Isn't the "old" authentication intent actually equal to the new "clientAuthentication" - and can we provide for migration in this area

Mike E: suggest making "authentication" a profile intent, which references clientAuthentication

Ashok moves to resolve Issue 32 with the proposal contained in the email of 8th Jan 2009, with the addition of a new profile intent (for migration purposes) called "authentication" which references the clientAuthentication intent

Mike E seconds

Motion passes unanimously

Resolution: Issue 32 is resolved with the proposal contained in <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200901/msg00007.html> with the addition of a new profile intent called "authentication" which references the clientAuthentication intent

Issue Status Reporting - for Liaison Committee

3 open issues

0 opened today

2 closed today

AOB

Next meeting 12th Jan

Close of Business