

DRAFT

SCA-Policy TC Teleconference

28 September 2009

Chairs

Dave Booz, Ashok Malhotra

Scribe

Mike Edwards

Attendees

Name	Company	Status
Dale Moberg	Axway Software*	Group Member
Eric Wells	Hitachi, Ltd.	Group Member
David Booz	IBM	Group Member
Mike Edwards	IBM	Group Member
Simon Holdsworth	IBM	Group Member
Martin Chapman	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Anish Karmarkar	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Rich Levinson	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Ashok Malhotra	Oracle Corporation	Group Member
Plamen Pavlov	SAP AG*	Group Member
Tai-Hsing Cha	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Murty Gurajada	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member
Pundalik Kudapkar	TIBCO Software Inc.	Group Member

Table of Contents

Resolutions.....	2
Actions.....	2
Agenda.....	2
(Item 3) Agenda Bashing.....	4
(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC.....	4
(Item 5) TC Administrivia.....	4
(Item 6) PRD Status.....	4
(Item 7) Action Items.....	4
(Item 8) New Issues.....	4
ISSUE-105: Clarifying the Domain Composite Infoset	4
ISSUE-107: Infoset for external attachment is confusing	4
(Item 9) Blocking Issue Discussion.....	5
(Item 10) Testing discussion.....	5
(Item 11) Additional Issue Discussion.....	5
ISSUE 87: Clarification re. values of @appliesTo.	5
SSUE 104: Clarify meaning of 'does not have to support intents' in Conformance section	6
AOB.....	6

Resolutions

Minutes of Policy TC meeting of September 21st are accepted

Issue 105 is closed with no action

Issue 107 is opened

Issue 104 is closed

Actions

ACTION 20090928-01: Ashok to prepare a detailed proposal for Issue 87

Agenda

1. Roll call

2. Confirm minute taker

3. Agenda bashing

4. Meeting Minutes

Vote to accept minutes from Sept 21 2009

- <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/34335/SCA%20Policy%20minutes%202009-09-21.pdf>

5. TC Administrivia:

a. Recording issue status - 5 Open

- b. Reminder - LOA for Martin:
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200909/msg00036.html>

- 6. PRD status update
 - a. 9 issues from PR 01 comment list that need responses

- 7. ACTION ITEMS:
 - a. 20090706-01: status=pending; Mike E: Prepare an updated version of the Specification containing the resolution of Issue 95
 - b. 20090921-01: status=done; Ashok to open a new issue to deal with the question of evolution and extensibility of intents
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-106>

- 8. New Issues
 - a. ISSUE-105: Clarifying the Domain Composite Infoset
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-105>

 - b. ISSUE-106: Extensibility of Intents
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-106>
Discussion: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200909/msg00058.html>

 - c. ISSUE-107: Infoset for external attachment is confusing
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-107>

- 9. Blocking Issue Discussion
None

- 10. Testing
 - a. Test assertion document status
Latest Documents (pdf): <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/33759/SCA-Policy-1.1-Test-Assertions-WD-03.pdf>
(doc): <http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/download.php/33758/SCA-Policy-1.1-Test-Assertions-WD-03.doc>
 - b. We need volunteers to begin writing test cases

- 11. Additional Issue Discussion
 - a. ISSUE 87: Clarification re. values of @appliesTo.
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-87>
Latest Discussion: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200909/msg00051.html>

 - b. ISSUE 94: Allow intents to be attached using an element
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-94>

 - c. ISSUE 93: Allow external attachment for intents
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-93>

 - d. ISSUE 92: Block Intent Inheritance
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-92>

 - e. ISSUE 104: Clarify meaning of 'does not have to support intents' in Conformance section

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-104>

12. AOB

a. straggler roll

(Item 3) Agenda Bashing

No changes

(Item 4) Minutes from previous meeting of Policy TC

Minutes from 21st September 2009

Minutes approved without change

Resolution: Minutes of Policy TC meeting of September 21st are accepted

(Item 5) TC Administrivia

5 open issues

(Item 6) PRD Status

a. 9 issues from PR 01 comment list that need responses

Ashok: But there are only 5 open issues

Dave: But we do have resolutions for some of the PRD issues, but we have not built an actual response for the original comments

(Item 7) Action Items

a. 20090706-01: status=pending; Mike E: Prepare an updated version of the Specification containing the resolution of Issue 95

b. 20090921-01: status=done; Ashok to open a new issue to deal with the question of evolution and extensibility of intents

(Item 8) New Issues

ISSUE-105: Clarifying the Domain Composite Infoset

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-105>

Ashok: Seems to cover the same ground as Issue 107 - we should only open 1 of them

Ashok moves to close Issue 105 with no action

Eric seconds

Motion accepted unanimously

Resolution: Issue 105 is closed with no action

ISSUE-107: Infoset for external attachment is confusing

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-107>

Dave explains the issue - it is one of clarifying the specification
Dave moves to open Issue 107
Eric seconds
Motion accepted unanimously

Resolution: Issue 107 is opened

Ashok: Do we need an action to propose wording?
Dave: There is a proposal in the JIRA
- there are already examples in that section, and I don't think we need to change them
Ashok: I like Raymond's diagram - it provides useful context
Dave: I think a diagram or diagrams for the existing issues would be better
- existing examples
Dave will look at a proposal for next week

ISSUE-106: Extensibility of Intents
<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-106>
Discussion: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200909/msg00058.html>

Ashok explains the issue
Ashok moves to open issue 106
Rich seconds
Motion passes unanimously
Issue 106 is opened

(Item 9) Blocking Issue Discussion

None

(Item 10) Testing discussion

No discussion

(Item 11) Additional Issue Discussion

ISSUE 87: Clarification re. values of @appliesTo.

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-87>
Latest Discussion: <http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200909/msg00051.html>

Ashok discusses the email above
Ashok: the question is whether we change the @appliesTo XPath evaluation - to use the Domain infoSet
Ashok: I think that it is simpler
Dave: What's the advantage of doing it from the composite root level?
Ashok: If you attach a policySet which is attached to the root composite element you would have to add context elements at each level with the current specification, and changing to use the Domain infoSet should be a lot simpler

Dave: Your concern is that the SCA runtime is going to have to iterate through all possible places where <binding/> can appear and check if the policySet applies there. What you want to change to is an XPath against all composites
Dave: Main use case is that you know that a policySet is associated with a given type of binding, then @appliesTo is for that (eg binding.ws)
Dave: So you're arguing that it would be simpler for (deployers etc) to use the same context root for both attributes

ACTION 20090928-01: Ashok to prepare a detailed proposal for Issue 87

Ashok: I ought to write proposals for Issues 92, 93, 94
Ashok: I did send out material for Issue 104 previously
-- it was actually part of the wording for Issue 79 since it covers the same ground
I

SSUE 104: Clarify meaning of 'does not have to support intents' in Conformance section

<http://www.osoa.org/jira/browse/POLICY-104>
<http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/sca-policy/200909/msg00011.html>
- Issue 79 Wording.doc

Ashok moves to close Issue 104 as a duplicate of Issue 79
Mike seconds
Motion passes unanimously

Resolution: Issue 104 is closed

AOB

None

Next meeting 5 October
Close of Business