Comments from Andrea Caccia based on hub-UBL-2.3-review-20190709-1130z.zip

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| # | Clause | Issue | Suggested change |
| AC-1 | 1.5 | [ASiC] reference points to an old version | Replace:  “[ASiC] Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Associated Signature Containers (ASiC). ETSI TS 102 918 V1.1.1, April 2011.”  with  “[ASiC] Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Associated Signature Containers (ASiC); Part 1: Building blocks and ASiC baseline containers. ETSI EN 319 162-1 V1.1.1, April 2016.” |
| AC-2 | All applicable | “advanced digital signature” is not defined and not necessary | Replace any occurrence of “advanced digital signature” or “advanced digital signatures” with “digital signature” or “digital signatures” |
| AC-3 | 1.3.3 | Abbreviation “AdES Advanced Electronic Signature” not use | Delete it |
| AC-4 | 5.3.1 | Use of “detached advanced electronic signature(s)” when “detached digital signature(s)” is meant | Replace:  “… associate the UBL document with detached advanced electronic signature(s) that apply to it”  with  “… associate the UBL document with detached digital signature(s) that apply to it” |
| AC-5 | 1.3.3 | Abbreviation “XAdES XML Advanced Electronic Signatures [XAdES]” refers to the previous ETSI specification title | Replace:  “XAdES XML Advanced Electronic Signatures [XAdES]”  with  “XAdES Digital Signature based on [XAdES]” |
| AC-6 | 5.2.3 |  | Replace:  “XAdES digital signatures build on XMLDSig by the incorporation…”  with  “XAdES builds on XMLDSig by the incorporation…” |
| AC-7 | 5.3.3.2 | The text “<ds:Reference URI="myInvoice.xml">” should be marked as an example | Change to:  The content to be signed is addressed in the URI= attribute of <ds:Reference>. For example:  <ds:Reference URI="myInvoice.xml"> |
| AC-8 | 5.3.1 + 1.5 | A note on possible use of DSS for signature creation and verification cen be helpful for implementors | At the end of the current text add the following note:  “Note:  XMLDSig and XAdES signatures can be created and verified using [DSS-v2.0] signature signing and verifying protocol.”  Add to 1.5:  “[DSS-v2.0] Digital Signature Service Core Protocols, Elements, and Bindings Version 2.0. Edited by Andreas Kuehne and Stefan Hagen. 07 January 2019. OASIS Committee Specification Draft 01 / Public Review Draft 02. http://docs.oasis-open.org/dss-x/dss-core/v2.0/csprd02/dss-core-v2.0-csprd02.html. Latest version: http://docs.oasis-open.org/dss-x/dss-core/v2.0/dss-core-v2.0.html.” |
| AC-9 | 5.3.1 + 1.5 | UBL 2.2 referenced an older version of XADES: a note on main differences between the old and the new version can be useful for implementors | After the note mentioned in comment AC-8 add the following note:  “Note:  The references to [XAdES] and [ASIC] standards have been updated from UBL 2.2 to UBL 2.3. Refers to [ETSI TR 119 112] for the Most significant differences between XAdES and ASiC ENs and the formerly referenced TSs”  Add to 1.5:  “[ETSI TR 119 112] ETSI TR 119 112 V1.1.1 (2019-04) - Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Most significant differences between AdES/ASiC ENs and previous TSs” |